DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 193 128 SO 012 852

AUTHOR Harris, Judah J.
TITLE The Treatment of Religion in Elementary School Social Studies Textbooks.
INSTITUTION B'nai B'rith, New York, N.Y. Anti-Defamation League.
PUB DATE 63
NOTE 73p.

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC03 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Catholics; Elementary Education; Jews; Protestants; *Religion; *Social Studies; Textbook Bias; Textbook Content; *Textbook Evaluation

ABSTRACT

This study, undertaken in 1963, analyzed the references made to religion in elementary social studies textbooks. The report was intended to inform authors, publishers, and teachers and enable them to correct errors, supply omissions, and omit irrelevant material. The textbooks used in the study consisted of 120 elementary (grades 1-6) public school social studies textbooks shelved in the Social Studies Division of the Teachers' Central Laboratory of Hunter College, New York City. Major findings included the following. The belief that nothing in the textbooks could violate the religious feelings of public school students was not true. Many books presented Protestantism in a more favorable light than Catholicism and Christianity more favorably than Judaism. There were definite sectarian tendencies in the textbooks. A numerical analysis of the subject matter revealed a disproportionate quantitative predominance of references to Christianity, even after the predominance of Christians in our population was taken into consideration. The texts portrayed present-day religion as no longer being a potent molding force in our society. This impression was conveyed by the tendency of the texts to discuss fully the role of religion in the past, but to give a sketchy, incomplete description of the part played by religion in contemporary culture. Christianity was depicted as being limited in its influence to moral and spiritual matters through church attendance, worship, and welfare work. Virtually nothing was said about Jewish life in America today. The historical facts about religious conflicts and persecutions were being presented in an inadequate fashion by the elementary social studies textbooks. (Author/RM)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

U S DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY Stanley Wexler

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

ED193128

SO 012 852

The treatment of religion in elementary school social studies textbooks

by

Judah J. Harris, Ph.D.

ANTI-DEFAMATION LEAGUE OF B'NAI BRITH
515 Madison Avenue, New York 22, N. Y.

Preface

Children are not born prejudiced. Negative attitudes along with information begin to be acquired in the home very early in life. Attitudes towards people different from the self receive either support or discouragement from peers and teachers in the school. Information about groups other than one's own is accumulated and misinformation about them is (or should be) corrected in the school. In other words, the school is a transmission belt which must be used to convey factual information to the young of each succeeding generation.

Along this transmission belt are class-mates, teachers, and the media or materials of instruction. Among these the textbook is of great importance. In its pages truth must be sought and found. Obviously, this means that the textbooks should contain information about the influence of religion on history and its significance in modern life. On the other hand, it also means that whatever is in the nature of teaching specific religious beliefs, doctrines and creeds should be omitted.

During the past decade controversy over the place of religion in education has risen, at times, to fever pitch. Some critics of the public schools declare them to be godless. Other critics express fear and anger over the possibility that the persistence and even introduction of a greater amount of religion into the public school will destroy the traditional wall of separation between church and state in America. And through all the heated debate, no one has had an answer to the questions: What religion, how is it treated, and how much of it is in the textbooks from which children in the elementary schools presently learn.

This study was undertaken to get the answers to these questions. It is concerned with negative attitudes and prejudices based upon religious differences. ADL presents this report with the hope that it will inform authors, publishers and teachers and enable them to correct errors, supply omissions and omit irrelevant material.

BENJAMIN R. EPSTEIN
National Director

Printed in the United States of America
Copyright — 1963

Table of Contents

PAGE

INTRODUCTION iv

I. EARLIER STUDIES, TEXTBOOKS EXAMINED AND AIMS 1

II. ARE THE TEXTBOOKS FOR ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS SECTARIAN IN THEIR OUTLOOK? . . 6

III. HOW DO THE TEXTBOOKS PRESENT THE ROLE OF RELIGION IN THE PAST AND IN CONTEMPORARY SOCIETY? 17

IV. HOW ARE RELIGIOUS CONFLICTS AND PERSECUTIONS TREATED? 33

V. SUMMARY 51

APPENDIX 55

Introduction

This study seeks to shed light on the way in which American public elementary schools deal with religion by analyzing the references made to religion in social studies textbooks used in these schools.

Although the entire subject of religion in education cries for investigation, as the numerous articles and pamphlets devoted to this theme testify,[1] to satisfy this need would require an exhaustive investigation. Meanwhile, important light can be thrown on the matter by a more limited inquiry into the contents of textbooks.

The textbook is only one of the means of instruction available to the public school elementary teacher. However, its influence is so massive that investigation of textbooks will clarify to a considerable extent the subject of religion in the classroom. This view is supported by the following statement made by the American Council on Education:

> . . . The position of the textbook in American schools is still powerful; it is still—whether one approves or not—the best clue we have to what is being taught and to the temper and interpretation of the subject matter to which pupils are exposed. There are many teachers who rise above the level of the textbook to widen pupils' horizons. . . . Even the worst of books can be trusted in their hands. There are many teachers, also, themselves so prejudiced, insensitive and unwise in human relations, that no textbook or program of studies is safe in their hands. And there are even more teachers, inadequately experienced in the social process, who simply follow unquestionably the course the textbook charts. For the great majority of schools in the United States the textbook is, and is likely to be for some time, the most accurate index of both the subject material presented and the temper and tone of instruction.[2]

The *Thirtieth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education* states, "It is the textbook that in thousands of classrooms

[1] For example, the entire April 1955 issue of the *Phi Delta Kappan* is devoted to "Religion in Education."

[2] American Council on Education, *Intergroup Relations in Teaching Materials*, 1948, p. 13.

determines the content of instruction as well as the teaching procedures. . . . One of the most effective ways for improving the content of instruction is to place better textbooks in the hands of teachers and pupils."[3]

William C. Bagley, writing in the same yearbook, says:

> There is a general impression that the textbook very largely dominates classroom instruction in American schools. This impression remains in spite of the wide and increasing vogue of an educational theory which lays a maximum of emphasis upon the all-'round growth and development of the individual, especially through meeting and solving the problems that arise in the course of his daily life.[4]

Importance of the Study. The American Council on Education in a recent investigation entitled *The Study of Religion in the Public Schools,* indicated the need to examine religion in the textbooks.[5] Eugene E. Dawson, President of Colorado Woman's College, in a paper delivered to the Council's Conference on Religion and Public Education, said that he had asked several leaders to indicate some of the needed research in the field of religion in public education.[6] The replies he received clearly called for a study of how textbooks treat religion.

Among the recommendations presented by one of the discussion groups at the Conference was one which called for examination of current textbooks and practices to determine, subject by subject, what references to religion and religious institutions are actually made in public schools today.

Another group recommended a survey of elementary and secondary textbooks which are now in use in public schools to determine how references to religion are made.[7]

Definition of "Religious Reference". All religions include within their scope *beliefs* and *affirmations* concerning God, Man, the Universe or Nature and Life After Death; also relationships involving God to Man, Man to Man, Man to God, God to the Universe, and God and Man to

[3] *Thirtieth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education,* "The Textbook in American Education," Part II, 1931, p. 2.
[4] *Ibid.,* p. 7.
[5] Nicholas C. Brown (ed.), *The Study of Religion in the Public Schools.* (1958).
[6] *Ibid.,* p. 189.
[7] *Ibid.*

the Universe. This study is concerned with that partial, but central and basic, phase of religion broadly conceived, namely, conceptions of God or deity, and the institutions and practices which grow out of and express the relationship of God to Man; Man to God; and God to Nature or the Natural World. An all-inclusive investigation of religion in textbooks would deal with expressions of naturalism and humanism as well as theism, but this study is limited to the investigation of the theistic aspect of religion and religious experience.

Data was sought in terms of references beyond the natural world and beyond man; beyond "science" and "ethics." While it is true that according to the Jewish and Christian religions the love of God is tested by the love of one's fellow man, the love of God nevertheless transcends merely human obligations. Thus, all direct references to God, the Divine, the Supreme Being, the Creator, the Beyond, were noted in context. Reference to religious institutions, practices, holy days, conceptions of life after death, religious persons and places are considered to be records of man being confronted by God, his encounter with God, or his seeking after and expressing relationship with God, and are therefore included in this study.

* * *

Since religion is a vital element in our culture, basic to this study is the conviction that school textbooks should present the role of religion in our society. However, in so doing, schools are obligated to the basic principles of democracy—to uphold the doctrine of separation of church and state, and to preserve religious freedom.

JUDAH J. HARRIS
New York
March 1963

Chapter I

Earlier Studies, Textbooks Examined and Aims

Among the several studies previously made of religious references in American textboooks, none has been devoted exclusively to the examination of religious references in American elementary school social studies textbooks. Some did include an examination of selected textbooks in use in the public schools. The gist of their findings follows:

In 1950, Harold Pflug of the Yale University Graduate School wrote his dissertation on the topic, "Theistic Religion in Missouri Public School Textbooks."[1] He sampled 113 texts in the fields of geography, reading, science, social science and literature, from the first through the twelfth grades. All theistic religious references in these books were classified and tabulated numerically. Religious overtones and/or undertones which were distinctly a part of the author's presentation were noted. The study concluded, "if the sample is taken as indicative, textbooks are not devoid of religious content. Neither are they devoid of what may be considered sectarian references, whether the reader be Catholic, Protestant, Jew, or a member of some other religious sect."[2] The author felt that the data from his study could help provide the reader with an answer to the question, "Are the Public Schools Godless?"

Dr. Pflug noted the following trends:

1. The number and volume of theistic religious references increases with advancing school grades. . . . The mere fact presents a striking contrast to the important place accorded to this period of childhood by professional religious educators.

---

[1] Harold A. Pflug, "Theistic Religion in Missouri Public School Textbooks" (unpublished dissertation, Yale University, 1950).

[2] *Ibid.*, p. 330.

2. The concepts used are inadequately defined, described, and interpreted. . . . Looking at the content of the data, and thinking of a pupil at each grade level bringing to his reading a Catholic, Protestant, Jewish, or a non-religious background, causes one to raise the question of the adequacy of explanation and interpretation of the religious terminology used.
3. The references deal largely with the outward expressions of religion, only rarely with religion as an inner experience.
4. It is possible to deal objectively and informatively with controversial religious matters.
5. The closer we get to textbook descriptions of present-day life and literature, the fewer theistic religious references there are. . . . Thus an alert student may feel that the textbook dealing with today's problems no longer cites religion as a molding force in society.[3]

From 1953 to 1956, fifteen institutions of higher education studied "the possible influence of religion in an educational curriculum and how logical integration may be made with subject matter without creedal or racial bias,"[4] under a grant from the Dansforth Foundation to the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education. Several of the participants wrote chapters in a pamphlet entitled, *Religion in the High School Curriculum*.[5] One of these, by John B. Bennett, is entitled "A Study of Religious Content in North Carolina Public School Textbooks."[6] He limited his study to English and social science textbooks in a sampling of 34 texts from the first through the twelfth grades. Bennett concluded that "if any religious orientation is to be expected of the public schools, such orientation will be left to the individual teacher, to the extracurricular program of the schools, or to the inclusion of material of religious value in the literature books used in the early eleventh and twelfth grades."[7] He further stated ". . . as the elementary books now stand they leave it entirely to the teacher or to chance circumstance to prepare children for the handling of religious problems. . . ."[8] He felt that the inadequate treatment of religion in North Carolina Public School textbooks provoked militant religious groups to cry that

[3] *Ibid.*
[4] Edgar Hirshberg *et al.*, Religion in the High School Curriculum (1956), p. III.
[5] *Ibid.*
[6] *Ibid.*, pp. 1-6.
[7] *Ibid.*, p. 2.
[8] *Ibid.*, p. 6.

the public schools were godless and to demand the introduction of emotionally charged religious programs.

In conclusion, Bennett stated that conferences should be held on the place of religion in the public schools and that "one of the items high on the agenda of these conferences and workshops would be the consideration of textbooks."[9]

The American Council on Education published a report entitled *Intergroup Relations in Teaching Materials, A Survey and Appraisal*[10] based on an examination of 266 public school texts and 49 college textbooks in the humanities, social sciences and literature. The study was conducted from 1944 to 1946, under a grant from the National Conference of Christians and Jews. Since group relations include relations with religious groups, the survey examined the treatment of sectarian religion in the texts on the assumption that an understanding of different faiths enhances one's understanding of and sympathy with other religious groups. The conclusions of the survey were divided into thirteen categories. Two of these, "Treatment of Religious Groups" and "Treatment of Jews," have relevance to this study.

1. Under the heading "Treatment of Religious Groups," the report concluded that textbooks assumed the desirability of religious groupings in society while pointing out that one of the causes of intergroup friction was misunderstanding caused by religious differences. The Inquisition period was evaluated by many texts outside of its historical context, and the evangelical aspects of Protestantism were sometimes caricatured. The study maintained that "too little appears in the texts on the exact nature of religious groups (either their differences or their likenesses) or on the common concern of church groups with ethical or humanitarian developments."[11]

2. Under the heading "Treatment of Jews," the study observed that three-fourths of the space allotted to Jews in world history texts dealt with events before 70 C.E. The assumption seemed to be that Judaism and Jewish culture had changed little since then. Reference to Jews after that date was usually in connection with persecution. There was little about constructive contributions of the group or about their relations with

[9] *Ibid.*
[10] American Council on Education, *Intergroup Relations in Teaching Materials* (1948).
[11] *Ibid.*, p. 33.

other groups. Many of the crucifixion accounts were "too generalized to be . . . accurate, and afford some basis for the development of prejudice among pupils." Many inaccuracies occurred in the description of Jews. Not much was said concerning cultural, religious and economic variations among Jews. The textbooks contained little to offset the "stereotypes of Jews which abound in contemporary social thinking."[12]

During the late 1940's and early 1950's the Hazen Foundation made a study of "Religion in College Reading." The results of the study were published under the title, *Religious Perspectives in College Teaching.*[13] The book, containing fourteen essays by teachers in the several academic fields, addressed itself to textbooks most frequently used by college undergraduates in the areas of education, philosophy, sociology, economics, music, natural sciences and literature. These qualified teachers were asked to investigate textbooks and recommended readings in their own fields, to discover the consideration given to religion. Even though the inquiry was made by teachers whose conceptions of religion and whose personal religious experiences differed widely, they arrived at the following conclusions:

1. Religion is a neglected field of study and reading on the part of college students.
2. The shallowness and even the ignorance with which intellectual issues having a religious bearing or impact are dealt with, seems little less than astonishing when the expansion of scholarship in general is taken into account.
3. "Hostility to religion revealed in some textbooks becomes perhaps most effective when it is implied or suggested through the aggressive development of a positivistic attitude."[14]
4. The various academic fields differ quite widely in the readiness with which they accept religion.[15]

Dr. Conrad Hauser, in his book, *Teaching Religion in the Public School*[16] and in his former study presented to the University of Pennsylvania as a doctor's dissertation, *Latent Religious Resources in Public School Education,*[17] included some study of religion in textbooks. The

---

12 *Ibid.*, p. 31.
13 Hoxie N. Fairchild (ed.), *Religious Perspectives in College Teaching* (1952).
14 *Ibid.*, p. 176.
15 *Ibid.*
16 Conrad Hauser, *Teaching Religion in the Public School* (1942).
17 Conrad Hauser, *Latent Religious Resources in Public School Education* (1924).

latter work used the Philadelphia outline courses of study in English, literature, history, the natural sciences and the social sciences. Dr. Hauser took the detailed outlines of these various courses of study, rather than specific textbooks, and endeavored to show how and where religious resources were latent in the course outlines presented. The bibliographies cited were largely from teachers' reading lists rather than pupils' textbooks.[18] Chapter VIII in *Teaching Religion in the Public School*, entitled "What Will Be Taught? Search the Public School Courses," suggested how religion might be treated on a non-sectarian basis in history, nature study, mathematics and other subjects. Again, courses of study and teachers' outlines were used rather than pupils' textbooks.

Textbooks Examined. The textbooks used in this study consist of 120 elementary (grades 1-6) public school social studies textbooks shelved in the Social Studies Division of the Teachers' Central Laboratory of Hunter College, New York City. The collection, one of the largest in the country, contains an extensive sampling of current texts selected in accordance with the recommendations of publishers, educators and textbook writers.

Questions to Be Explored. The following chapters are addressed to four questions found to be of primary interest to religious groups, educators and leaders in the field of church-state relations. The questions are based on criteria these individuals and groups deemed essential for presentation by the public schools of the role of religion in our culture which would not violate religious liberty or the doctrine of the separation of church and state. The questions the study attempts to answer are:

1. Is there anything in the textbooks which might reflect unfavorably upon the religious ideas brought by the child to the public school from home, church, or synagogue?[19]
2. What evidence is there in the textbooks that public schools are or are not sectarian in outlook?
3. Are the textbooks giving a clear picture of the role of religion in the past and in contemporary society?
4. How are the historical facts about religious conflicts and persecution presented?

[18] *Ibid.*

[19] The first question is not dealt with separately, but as part of the discussion of the other three.

Chapter II

Are the Textbooks for Elementary Schools Sectarian in Their Outlook?

The First Amendment to the Constitution of the United States declares that "Congress shall make no law respecting an establishment of religion, or prohibiting the free exercise thereof. . . ." Mr. Justice Black, speaking for the majority of the Supreme Court in *Everson* v. *Board of Education*[1], declared that "the clause against establishment of religion by law was intended to erect 'a wall of separation between church and state.' "[2] This was specifically applied to children studying in the public schools by Mr. Justice Frankfurter in his concurring opinion in *McCollum* v. *Board of Education*[3] when he wrote:

> . . . The . . . public school was the means of reconciling freedom in general with religious freedom. The sharp confinement of the public schools to secular education was a recognition of the need of a democratic society to educate its children, insofar as the state undertook to do so, in an atmosphere free from pressures in a realm in which pressures are most resisted and where conflicts are most easily and most bitterly engendered. Designed to serve as perhaps the most powerful agency for promoting cohesion among a heterogeneous democratic people, the public school must keep scrupulously free from entanglement in the strife of sects. . . ."[4]

According to those two opinions, anything taught in the public schools which is sectarian or which reflects unfavorably upon the religious ideas brought by the child from home and church or synagogue violates the spirit, if not the letter, of the Constitution.

Textbook Treatment of the Reformation. Undoubtedly, one of the most controversial events in the history of Christianity is the Reformation.

---

[1] 330 U.S. 1 (1947).
[2] *Id.* at 16.
[3] 333 U.S. 203 (1948). Justices Jackson, Rutledge, and Burton joined with Mr. Justice Frankfurter in his concurring opinion.
[4] *Id.* at 216-17.

An inaccurate or insensitive treatment of this topic can be disturbing to Protestant and/or Catholic pupils. It is, however, extremely difficult to treat such a topic in an impartial fashion. Mr. Justice Jackson puts the matter thus in *McCollum* v. *Board of Education*:

> The fact is that, for good or for ill, nearly everything in our culture worth transmitting . . . is saturated with religious influences. . . . But how one can teach, with satisfaction or even with justice to all faiths, such subjects as the story of the Reformation . . . is far more than I know.[5]

Justice Jackson recognizes that teaching about the Reformation presents a dilemma. On the one hand, it is an important part of our cultural heritage. At the same time, it is apparently impossible to teach the topic without doing an injustice to one faith or the other. However, the Constitution does *not* require that the public school should keep its students in ignorance of important cultural events even if they are connected with religion.[6] In the light of this, it is interesting to note the manner in which such controversial topics as the Reformation are actually presented.

The Reformation was accompanied by an "unprecedented outburst of intolerance and cruelty in which both Protestants and Catholics participated."[7] During this period of great religious, political and social upheaval, participants in the religious struggles engaged in persecution. The United States Supreme Court decision, *Everson* v. *Board of Education*, states:

> The centuries before and contemporaneous with the colonization of America had been filled with turmoil, civil strife, and persecution, generated in large part by established sects determined to maintain their absolute religious supremacy. With the power of government supporting them, at various times and places, Catholics had persecuted Protestants, Protestants had persecuted Catholics, Protestant sects had persecuted other Protestant sects, Catholics of one shade of belief had persecuted Catholics of another shade of belief, and all of these from time to time persecuted Jews.[8]

Considering the widespread participation of both Catholics and Protestants in the religious strife of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, it would be unduly partial for a textbook to create the impression that

---

[5] *Id.* at 235.
[6] Leo Pfeffer, *Church, State and Freedom*, p. 309.
[7] William Warren Sweet, *Religion in Colonial America*, p. 320.
[8] *Everson* v. *Board of Education*, 330 U.S. 1 (1947).

one religious group was more responsible than another for the religious intolerance of the era. Moreover, religious officials were often not the moving spirit in the persecutions, but were urged on by the state, which used religion as a tool for its own policy.[9]

In the books used in this study, there is a definite tendency to present the Roman Catholic Church in a less favorable light than the Protestant Churches. The Catholic Church is often treated as evil, cruel and arbitrary. For example, one school book, in introducing the Reformation says:

> As early as the 12th century . . . some groups of Christians were against the Pope having so much power. They said the church members should be guided by the Bible and not by the Clergy. Many of this group were dismissed from the church and executed. But their ideas did not die.

The text then goes on to describe the views of Wycliffe, but fails to indicate the Church's reasons for opposing them. Speaking of the trial of John Huss, which was followed by burning him at the stake, the authors wrote:

> At his trial, John Huss said he would change his ideas if anyone would prove his criticisms were not true. The church did not try to prove him wrong.

The picture drawn by this text is typical. Those who oppose the church are shown as rational, sincere individuals legitimately opposing a Church which seems to be ruled by an arbitrary clergy instead of the Bible. For these activities they are unreasonably punished, harassed and even executed. Like most of the texts dealing with the Reformation, this one elaborates upon the reasons for the Protestant revolt, but says nothing about the reasons for the Church's actions.

Sometimes a picture can have a more powerful effect than words in conveying the impression of a cruel Church. One text pictures John Huss tied to the stake awaiting execution, with a priest, who holds a crucifix and a Bible in his hand, standing before him. The notion that the leaders of his religion cruelly burned their opponents without cause and that Catholic clergy officiated at these executions, is hardly in keeping with what Catholic children are taught to believe. This can be particularly

[9] See, e.g. Cyril Garbett, *Church and State in England*, p. 93, for examples of clergymen being forced by the state to take oppressive measures.

distressing to the elementary school child who, holding his religion in awed reverence, is now confronted with what purports to be an objective account of cruel and unjust actions taken by his Church four centuries ago. It is interesting to note that as early as 1841 the New York Public School Society, after an investigation by its textbook committee, decided to remove a description of the trial and burning of John Huss when Bishop Hughes complained that this and other incidents tend to make the Catholic child regard the "intemperance and vice set forth as the necessary and natural effects of the Catholic religion."[10]

Should not textbooks be required to treat the delicate topic of Catholic persecution of Protestant reformers more tactfully? Should not such factors as the Counter-Reformation, the political reasons for fearing anti-Catholic ascendancy, the later intolerance of Protestants towards Catholics, and the changed conditions in the modern church, also be included in order to present a fairer treatment of the birth of Protestantism? Although one text mentions in passing that "the Catholics imprisoned, banished and burned Protestants, and Protestants treated Catholics just as harshly," none gives in detail a Protestant act of persecution against Catholics. The execution of a great Catholic figure, such as Thomas More,[11] for refusing to give up his beliefs, might be cited as one of the unfortunate results of the Reformation.[12]

Martin Luther. The textbooks as a whole treat Martin Luther as the most important personality of the Reformation. Some textbooks convey the impression that all Protestants were followers of Luther's teachings. He is treated in a wholly favorable light; no adverse criticism is made of him or his teachings. In general, he is portrayed as a courageous individual who believed in freedom of conscience at all costs. The following excerpt is illustrative:

> The Pope issued a document ordering him to burn his writings and to take back his statements against the Church. . . . Instead of burning his own writings, Luther built a bonfire and burned the Pope's document.
>
> Luther was then summoned by the emperor of Germany. . . . His friends . . . tried to persuade him not to go, but he replied, "I am law-

---

[10] Stokes, *Church and State in the United States*, p. 577.

[11] For such a treatment see Wallace K. Ferguson and Geoffrey Bruun, *A Survey of European Civilization*, Part I, p. 418.

[12] A similar criticism was voiced by the American Council on Education, *Intergroup Relations in Teaching Materials*, p. 160.

fully summoned to appear in that city and thither will I go in the name of the Lord, though as many devils as there are ties on the roofs of houses were there combined against me."

Charles II sat on a throne. Churchmen and princes stood near him. . . . Would he withdrew what he had written?

Luther replied, ". . . It is impossible for me to recant unless I am proved to be in the wrong by the testimony of the Scriptures or by evident reasoning. I believe things contrary to the Pope and Councils because it is clear as day that they have erred and said things inconsistent with themselves. . . . To act against conscience is unholy and unsafe. God help me! Amen."

At the next meeting Luther was declared a heretic.

Such descriptions of Luther's courage in support of views which appear to be in keeping with modern concepts of religious liberty do not present the complete story of Luther's life and ideas. Moreover, if left to stand alone, they give a distorted picture of the ideas and actions of the anti-Catholic reformers. Can the rest of the story be omitted? When Luther gained a following he ceased to be a hunted heretic and recommended the following attitude toward dissenters:

> Heretics are not to be disputed with, but to be condemned unheard, and whilst they perish by fire, the faithful ought to pursue the evil to its source, and bathe their hands in the blood of the Catholic bishops, and of the Pope, who is a devil in disguise.[13]

Luther and his followers became as intolerant of the Church as the Catholic clergymen were of him. Many Catholics chose to leave Europe because of religious persecution at about the same time that Protestants were coming to the New World. For example, followers of Lord Baltimore were seeking the right to practice Catholicism when they founded the colony of Maryland.[14]

To give the impression that Luther and other Protestant leaders fully believed in freedom of conscience offends against historical truth. When this is contrasted to the treatment of the Catholic Church as arbitrary and cruel, we find a confirmation of the tendency of American elementary

---

[13] Quoted in Lord Acton, "The Protestant Theory of Persecution," *Essays on Freedom and Power*, p. 103.

[14] Evarts B. Greene, *Religion and State*, p. 53. See also Charles and Mary Beard, *The Rise of American Civilization* (Part I, One Vol. Ed.), p. 61, which shows that Lord Baltimore first turned to Catholics for colonization.

public school social studies textbooks to treat the Church of the Reformation period as almost wholly bad and the reformers as almost wholly good. As the American Council of Education said in its survey of teaching materials used in American educational institutions, "The Roman Catholic Church was not the exclusive agency of reaction nor the Protestant churches of progress . . . Fair and accurate presentation of historical facts is necessary."[15]

The Treatment of Jesus in the Textbooks. Although only one textbook among the 120 examined is actually devoted in its entirety to religious instruction, many textbooks, in the course of explaining historical events, describe great religious personages. In so doing, they often include statements which become religious indoctrination, because they cannot be accepted by members of all faiths. In discussions concerning Jesus, for example, any language which intimates the messiahship or divinity of the Nazarene would fall into this category. In addition, any references which impute evil motives to the Jews of ancient Palestine in their treatment of Jesus might tend to affect adversely the feelings of Jewish students and fan the sparks of prejudice.[16]

Jesus is always introduced in discussion of the history of the Roman Empire. Historically speaking, his life constitutes a significant part of Roman history and is so treated. But the manner in which his life is treated is generally offensive, to a greater or lesser degree, to the non-Christian student.

One text, for example, introduces the "Beginning and Spread of Christianity" with the statement that Jesus was "A Hebrew teacher whose perfect life and religious teaching began what was later called the Christian religion." The identification of Jesus as a Hebrew is of course accurate. However, while Christians believe that his perfection is something more than human—is, in fact, divine—that belief is not accepted by non-Christians.

A passage from a volume on Old World History speaks of Jesus and his death as follows:

> Jesus began traveling about in Palestine . . . the small land where

[15] American Council on Education, *op. cit.*, pp. 160-161.

[16] American Council on Education, *op. cit.*, p. 160. V. also Harry Schneiderman, et. al., "Anti-Semitism," *Universal Jewish Encyclopedia*, I, p. 344.

> he was born. He talked to the people who gathered about him. He talked to them about being good neighbors. He told them that all men are brothers. He asked them to believe in a just and loving God who was their Father in Heaven.
>
> The teachings of Jesus stirred up hate for him among some of the Jewish leaders. They feared that the words of Jesus would make trouble and that the Roman rulers would blame them for it. They urged the Roman governor to do away with Jesus. At last the Roman governor allowed Jesus to be put to death on a cross.

The text might easily leave the impression in the minds of immature elementary school children that the teachings about being good neighbors, the brotherhood of all men, and the just and loving God who is the father of all men, were the reasons why Jesus was hated by "some of the Jewish leaders" and that such teachings were not Jewish. However, the precepts are essentially Judaic and are part of Old Testament and Talmudic doctrine. Not only does the text tend to create misunderstanding about Judaism, it also tends to derogate the dignity of the Jewish religion and thus offends the feelings of Jewish students.

Of equal importance is omission of Jesus' claim to be the Messiah, which was the main reason for the Jewish leaders' fears. In this way the passage may encourage anti-Jewish feelings.

Since some investigators of prejudice believe that faulty accounts of the Crucifixion story play an important part in stimulating anti-Semitism,[17] it is important for textbooks to treat the subject carefully and prudently. The passage under discussion is likely to wound religious feelings and create prejudice.

Statements that offend the religious sensibilities of elementary school students may occur elsewhere than in the body of the text. For example, in a student exercise on the above passage, Question No. 2 asks: "Why was it that the Jewish leaders did not like many of the things Jesus said?" And Question No. 3 is: "Even the Roman Emperors did not like the Christians. Why was that?"

If Question No. 2 is answered in accordance with the passage quoted above, the student must write that the words of Jesus (which the text

[17] American Council on Education, *op. cit.*, p. 160, V. also Harry Schneiderman, et. al., "Anti-Semitism," *Universal Jewish Encyclopedia*, Vol. 1, p. 344.

describes as having to do with brotherhood and love) created fear among the Jewish leaders that trouble would be stirred up and that the Romans would blame them for it. This, of course, tends to reinforce undesirable reactions in students. Question No. 3, by stating that *even* the Roman emperors disliked the Christians, implies that it was more natural for the Jews (mentioned in Question No. 2) to dislike Jesus than for the Romans. Such an implication hardly promotes interfaith understanding. Moreover, it might give the Jewish student the impression that the public school is teaching that the Jews condemned those very principles which the Jewish home and synagogue hold to be precepts of Judaism.[18]

In addition to the discussion of Jesus as a teacher, there is the matter of the humanity or divinity of the Founder of Christianity, which is bound to leave the textbook writer in a serious dilemma. If he treats Jesus as a great human being, he risks offending those students who consider him to be divine; if he deals with Jesus as an incarnation of God, he makes a theological point that may disturb those who do not share this view.

Two of the seven texts that touch upon the qualities of Jesus treat him as purely human. People who believe that teaching which suggests that Jesus is divine is unconstitutional, would probably object to the manner in which the subject is treated in the majority of the texts. On the other hand, Christians who believe Jesus should be treated only as the divine Son of God may not consider that strong enough emphasis is placed upon it in the elementary social studies textbooks. Should not tax-supported public schools, where children of all faith congregate, be free from teaching sectarian religion no matter how important such teaching may appear to some people?[19]

Miscellaneous References. Christianity, of course, is touched upon in many of the textbooks. Indeed, it is impossible for a social studies course in Western Culture to avoid reference to this subject. However, the very

---

[18] Since the inception of this study in 1960, the textbook from which this passage concerning Jesus and the Jews is taken has gone out of print.

[19] See Mr. Justice Frankfurter's statement in *McCollum* v. *Board of Education*, 333 U.S. 203, 216-17: ". . . the preservation of the community from divisive conflicts . . . requires strict confinement of the state to instruction other than religious, leaving to the individuals' church and home, indoctrination in the faith of his choice."

nature of the subject is such that the religious feelings of many pupils may easily be hurt. For example, some textbooks intimate that everything Christian is of necessity good while everything non-Christian is of necessity bad.[20] Others suggest that Christianity is the oldest and the only significant influence for good in the world, or that democracy is based on Christianity.[21] It is apparent that statements ascribing the sole credit for the laws and customs of our democratic society to Christianity, or passages equating "Christianity" and "good," are not in harmony with the spirit of the Constitution and the principles of American freedom.

Other texts make the common error of equating "good people" with Christians. Are students to believe, then, that non-Christians are bad? This can hardly be expected to please the feelings of non-Christian students. And what does this do to create unwholesome attitudes in Christian pupils toward those of other faiths? The American Council on Education has pointed out, "It is simple for the child to make the distinction between 'Christian' or 'good' on the one hand and 'non-Christian' or 'bad' on the other."[22]

Because the majority of Americans are Christians, some textbook writers tend to assume that all who use their books will be adherents of that faith. Occasionally, therefore, we find passages about the Christmas season that appear to be directed at a purely Christian audience. One example is:

> Christmas in the Hawaiian Islands is very much like your Christmas...

This might better read ". . . much like Christmas on the mainland."

Religious Balance. It is the purpose of this section of the study to determine whether the views of one religious group predominate to such a degree that objectivity is sacrificed. If so, the contents of American public elementary school social studies textbooks can be termed sectarian. A rough idea of the comparative importance assigned to the several religions in contemporary American society can be gained by an evaluation of references to churches, mosques, synagogues and religious holidays.

---

[20] V. the statement in American Council on Education, *Intergroup Relations in Teaching Materials*, p. 145, to this effect.

[21] V. *Ibid.*, pp. 173-4, which discuss the importance of mentioning Hebraic influence through Christianity in this connection.

[22] American Council on Education, *op. cit.*, p. 145.

Present-day external manifestations of Christian influence (e.g., churches, holidays, etc.) appear 1170 times while similar indications of the Jewish faith appear only five times, or less than one-half of one per cent as often.[23]

As can be seen, the emphasis on present-day religious manifestations is strongly Christian while comparable Jewish references are virtually neglected. While it cannot and should not be expected that equal attention be given to both religions, it nevertheless seems apparent that the references are so predominantly Christian as to bring their objectivity into question.

In 1949, the American Council on Education said, "In view of the history of the Jewish people, their position today and their relation to current world affairs, it would seem educational wisdom to give a carefully balanced and adequate description of them."[24] In light of this, the current treatment and description of present day Jews and their customs in the texts shows a lack of "educational wisdom."

Summary. An examination of the texts reveals that the Reformation is treated in a manner which unduly favors Protestantism over Catholicism. Many anti-Protestant acts of persecution are detailed, but no specific acts of anti-Catholic oppression by Protestants are included. Martin Luther is treated in a wholly favorable light as a champion of freedom and enlightenment; no hint is given of the intolerance he advocated and practiced toward those whom he considered heretics. Little space is given to such movements as the Counter Reformation or to the fact that the religious intolerance of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries was by no means a Catholic monopoly.

Passages in elementary school social studies textbooks may tend to disturb non-Christian students. Some texts treat Jesus as divine or as the Messiah. The relationship of the founder of Christianity to the Jews

---

[23] The investigator fully realizes the ludicrous extremes one can go to by an undue reliance of quantitative references. Such a situation was well illustrated by the July 9, 1959 issue of *The Reporter*, which quoted an AP dispatch concerning the California Senate. One of its Committees had complained that a new series of textbooks, *Music for Living*, adopted by the State Department of Education, was "inferior in patriotic content to the books previously used. The word 'freedom' was said to appear 31 times and 'liberty' 15 times in the old series compared to 11 and 7 for the new books."

[24] American Council on Education, *Intergroup Relations in Teaching Materials*, p. 101.

of his time is often portrayed in a manner which makes the Jewish leaders seem selfish, cruel and arbitrary. Some texts put the primary blame for the Crucifixion on the Jews.

A third way in which texts may contradict the religious ideas of some public school students is their tendency to treat Christianity as being synonymous with everything good, so that by implication everything not Christian is bad. Some books claim that the Christian religion was the first to nurture feelings of brotherly love, or that America is a Christian country based on Christian principles. Also, it is sometimes assumed that all elementary school students are Christians and that they all observe Christmas.

Sectarian tendencies in elementary social studies textbooks are manifested in the disproportionate number of references to one religion as compared with others. The balance is in favor of Christianity to an extent that must be considered unfair even when considering the predominance of Christians in our population. References to Jewish holidays, institutions and customs are all but omitted.

Chapter III

How Do the Textbooks Present the Role of Religion in the Past and in Contemporary Society?

In 1950, Dr. Harold Pflug, in his dissertation on "Theistic Religion in Missouri Public School Textbooks,"[1] noted that textbooks "are not devoid of religious content,"[2] and observed:

> The closer we get to textbook descriptions of present-day life and literature, the fewer theistic religious references there are. . . . Thus, an alert student may feel that the textbook dealing with today's problems no longer cites religion as a molding force in society.[3]

From the 17th through the 19th centuries textbooks in American state-supported schools emphasized the importance of religion in life. The famous New England Primer, used in 17th century colonial schools, not only emphasized religion but was religious in outlook and purpose.[4] The Lord's Prayer was a favorite text of the so-called "horn books" which were widely used in early New England elementary schools.[5] This is readily understood in the light of the purposes of early colonial schools. For example, the first general law providing for schools, passed in 1647 by the Massachusetts Bay Colony, indicates the dominant motive in its preamble:

> It being one chief project of that old deluder, Satan, to keep men from the knowledge of the Scriptures, as, in former times, keeping them in an

---

[1] Harold A. Pflug, "Theistic Religion in Missouri Public School Textbooks" (unpublished dissertation, Yale University, 1950). See the beginning of Chapter I of this study. An article by Dr. Pflug based on the dissertation, appeared in the April, 1955 issue of *Phi Delta Kappan* (Vol. 36), pp. 258-60.

[2] *Ibid.*, p. 330.

[3] *Ibid.* See also *Phi Delta Kappan*, XXXVI (April, 1955), p. 260.

[4] Charles A. and Mary R. Beard, *The Rise of American Civilization* (Part I, One Vol. Ed.), p. 180.

[5] "Education," *Compton's Pictured Encyclopedia*, Volume 4, p. 176.

> unknown tongue, so in these later times, by persuading them from the use of tongues; so that at last the true sense and meaning might be clouded and corrupted with false glosses of deceivers; and to the end that learning may not be buried in the graves of our forefathers. . . .[6]

After stating this purpose the law provided that an elementary school should be established in every town of fifty families, and a Latin school in every town of one hundred families. In 1650 the Connecticut colony passed a law of similar import.[7] This close connection between religion and education continued until the end of the eighteenth century.[8]

Even when the schools were no longer officially motivated by a desire to teach the Bible as their main purpose, elementary school textbooks implied that religion was a vital force in the educational process. Thus, Dr. Harvey C. Minnich, Dean Emeritus of Miami University and curator of the McGuffey Museum, writes that the "McGuffey Readers" left a clear impression of the importance in life of religion and a religious outlook.[9] These readers were widely used in American elementary schools in the latter half of the nineteenth century. Analysis of the content of thirty-three McGuffey readers showed that the topics most frequently occurring in order of their importance were: (1) Ethics and Morals; (2) God; (3) Death and Immortality.[10] However, there apparently were objections to this emphasis on religion. In his preface to the *Fourth Reader* (first edition) McGuffey justifies his wide use of Biblical literature in both prose and poetry by saying, "In a Christian country that man is to be pitied who at this day can honestly object to imbuing the minds of the youth with the language and spirit of the word of God."[11]

In early American elementary school textbooks religion was considered an important cultural force. But, it has been said, religion is treated today as something which was significant in the past but is no longer so.[12] Examination of the social studies texts casts light on this subject.

---

[6] Quoted in Paul Monroe, *A Brief Course in the History of Education*, pp. 211-12.
[7] *Ibid.*, p. 212.
[8] *Ibid.*, p. 392.
[9] Harold A. Pflug, *Op. Cit.*, p. 44, referring to Harvey C. Minnich, *William Holmes McGuffey and His Readers.*
[10] *Ibid.*, p. 45.
[11] Quoted *Ibid.*
[12] V. footnote 3.

Reasons Advanced for the Inclusion of Religious Information in the Texts. Dr. Prentiss Pemberton, Associate Director of the Danforth Foundation, which has made numerous studies of religion and its relation to public education, stated that several areas of agreement have emerged from the "great debate" on religion and the public schools. One of these is that "religion, having been an inherent part of history, art and politics, must be an intrinsic part of public education in those fields. There should be no 'curricular boycott' of religion."[13]

This view was echoed by the late Associate Justice of the United States Supreme Court, Robert H. Jackson, in his concurring opinion in *McCollum* v. *Board of Education*. Commenting on the necessity of including religion in the public school curriculum, he said:

> Perhaps subjects such as mathematics, physics, or chemistry are, or can be, completely secularized. But it would not seem practical to teach either practice or appreciation of the arts if we are to forbid exposure of youth to any religious influences. Music without sacred music, architecture minus the cathedral, or painting without the scriptural themes would be eccentric and incomplete, even from a secular point of view. . . . And I should suppose it is a proper, if not an indispensable, part of preparation for a worldly life to know the roles that religion and religions have played in the tragic story of mankind. The fact is that for good or ill nearly everything that gives meaning to life is saturated with religious influences. . . . One can hardly respect a system of education that would leave the student wholly ignorant of currents of religious thought that move the world society for a part in which he is being prepared.[14]

It should be noted that not only does Justice Jackson acknowledge the importance of religion in the cultural heritage of the past, but also its role as one of the moving forces of contemporary society. This underlines the importance of finding out if religion is treated in the textbooks as important in contemporary society as well as in the past.

Both Jewish and Christian leaders have emphasized the importance of giving the child an awareness of the cultural significance of religion through the medium of the public school. The National Education Association, declared that the public schools can and should teach *about*

---

[13] Prentiss Pemberton, "The Religious Task of Public Education," in Ellis F. Hartford (ed.) *The Public Schools, Religion and Values* (1956), p. 44.

[14] 333 U.S. 203, 235-6. The statement is erroneously attributed to Associate Justice Black in Lewis Bliss Whittemore, *The Church and Secular Education*, p. 30.

religion since it is "essential for a full understanding of our culture, literature, art, history and current affairs."[15] Similar observations have also been made by such important students of church-state affairs as Anson Phelps Stokes,[16] Dr. M. Searle Bates[17] and Leo Pfeffer.[18] There is virtual unanimity that the public schools should convey an appreciation of the fact that religion is a continuing strong force in contemporary culture.

Religion in the Past. Textbooks stress the contributions of religion to culture in past eras in several ways. One of these is by showing the religious origins of various institutions and functions of society which have been taken over, in whole or in part, by governmental and non-religious private groups. For example, after describing the Egyptian contribution to the development of architecture, one text says, "The desire of the Egyptians to have a fine resting place for the dead and to honor the gods led them to learn much about building and carving." Another book credits the temple builders of Samaria and Babylonia with being the first to use symbols for numbers and to devise a system of weights and measures for building the temples and buying and selling temple grain. A sixth grade text credits Babylonian temple priests with originating the world's first banks. The origin of modern set-back skyscrapers is traced to the Babylonian temple builders by another social studies book.

The significance of the ancient Semitic religions of early Egypt and Asia Minor is not neglected. They are treated as a vital force in building, business, art and mathematics. Their permanent legacy to these fields is emphasized by showing the indebtedness of the modern world to the religious leaders, priests and temple builders of the ancient Middle East.

The significant influence of Greek religion on the development of art and architecture is a subject of study in fourteen texts. Emphasis is laid on the contribution of sculptured images of Greek gods and of Greek temple architecture.

---

[15] National Education Association. *Moral and Spiritual Values in the Public Schools* (1951), pp. 77-78.

[16] Anson Phelps Stokes, *Church and State in the United States*, Vol. II, p. 497.

[17] M. Searle Bates, *Religious Liberty: An Inquiry*, pp. 325, 375-6.

[18] Leo Pfeffer, *Church, State and Freedom*, p. 306.

The enrichment of world literature by mythology is also discussed in one of the texts. Another school book devotes thirty-one pages to Greek mythology and twenty-two pages of stories to Norse mythology.

The contributions of Greek religion to the development of sport is mentioned by two social studies textbooks. Both mention the origin of the Olympic games as a festival in honor of Zeus. One of these texts emphasizes that "we must not forget that the Olympics were a religious festival . . . they were meeting in honor of their greatest god."

Although the contributions of extinct religions to our cultural legacy are significant, the gifts of extant religions to our way of life naturally attract greater interest. Since modern religions are very much a part of the contemporary scene, the impression conveyed about their past cultural contributions vitally affects the elementary school child's sense of their worth and value as a living force. Therefore, attention must be directed to what books say about the past contributions of present-day religions.

Several schoolbooks devote space to the contributions of the Moslems to civilization. A typical excerpt informs the reader that the Mohammedans "learned everything the Greeks had found out about science, math, medicine, geography, and philosophy; and they added much to this knowledge. . . . Even today we use Arabic words for ideas and things which Western Europe learned from the Moors. . . . Algebra, almanac, cotton, damask, muslin, alfalfa, alcohol, alcove, cupola." Such treatment performs an important educational service in correcting the impression that the Islamic nations, whose importance is rising on the current world scene, can be dismissed as so-called "backward" peoples.

Of course, the role of Christianity in the development of our social institutions receives much attention in the textbooks. Sixteen refer to the monks of the Middle Ages as being important for their work in developing hospitals or for keeping the learning of that time alive. An intermediate grade text tells how discoveries of ancient Greek works in monasteries helped to spark the "new learning" which developed into the Renaissance. One textbook relates, "The monks were the only ones left in Europe who cared about books. . . . The monks not only helped

men in their time; they helped men of all times by saving the great books written by scholars of ancient times."

Another social studies volume credits the monks with being "the best-educated men of the Middle Ages," and states further: "All the learned men and teachers of the time were monks. The only schools in Europe, except the cathedral school for priests, were the Monastery schools. . . . The monks . . . helped to keep learning alive. . . ." The statement, "The monks were the best-educated men of the Middle Ages" is repeated in an intermediate grade book, which adds, "During hundreds of years the monks made the only books there were."

Such statements overlook the role of the great Jewish scholars of Medieval Europe, such as Rashi, Rashbam and Gersonides. However, the main point is that the historic contribution of religion to the development of learning is emphasized in elementary social studies books.

The work of the churches in setting up schools and thereby promoting education also receives attention in the textbooks. One tells about the schools established by the monasteries and cathedrals, and emphasizes the importance of these educational institutions, some of which became universities. Religiously inspired works of such artists as Michelangelo are not neglected. The contributions to architecture of the cathedral builders are also cited. Pointed arches, high pitched roofs, tall spires, great stained glass windows, carved stone decorations and statuary are described. In all, twenty texts deal with the effects of Christian devotion on the art and architecture of Europe. However, not a single text among those examined mentions religious contributions to the development of music.[19]

The influence of Christianity in Medieval Europe is emphasized. It is portrayed as a beacon of light in a bleak period of world history. The Christian religion is portrayed as the leading cultural force of the so-called Dark Ages and it is given credit for preserving the ancient culture which formed the basis of the Renaissance. Modern universities, hospitals, libraries and hotels are depicted as being an outgrowth of institutions first established by the monks of that period. Christianity is

[19] Some texts mention the introduction of congregation hymn singing to the Church service after the Reformation. However, religious influence on general music is neglected.

correctly represented as playing a major role in the society of Medieval Europe.

The part played by Christian movements is also given considerable emphasis in the texts dealing with Old World history. Every one of the thirteen texts that mention the Crusaders, describes their religious character and discusses the role they played in trade, travel and exploration. Some texts criticize the Crusades for the violent persecutions with which they were sometimes associated. (An analysis of the manner in which the religious persecutions resulting from the Crusades is treated will be found in Chapter IV of this study.)

The nine schoolbooks which deal with the Reformation describe the way in which this movement precipitated fierce religious conflicts which were subsequently assuaged by the growth of religious tolerance when men saw the futility of such wars.

A student acquiring a knowledge of European history up to the eighteenth century from these textbooks cannot but be impressed by the great role played by Christianity in the development of European culture and social institutions.

Religion in Early American History. The role of religion in the early settlement of the United States is well known. The Pilgrims, Puritans and Quakers looked upon themselves primarily as religious groups and only secondarily as builders of a New World.

The story of the Pilgrims occupies an important place in twenty-two textbooks dealing with the colonization of North America. Credit is given to them for having founded the first successful permanent settlement in what is now the United States. Their strong and central religious motivation is always stressed as the reason for their migrating to America. The institution of the feast of Thanksgiving by the Pilgrims is usually included.

The work of the Puritans in the settlement of this country also receives a great deal of attention. There were references to them in a total of twenty-three texts. Their strict adherence to religious teachings forms a significant part of their description.

Quaker efforts and the significance of religious motivation in the settling and building up of Philadelphia and Pennsylvania are given due

place in fifteen of the social studies books. The early life of William Penn as a member of a condemned minority religion in England is usually given as background information.

The work of the followers of Thomas Hooker in settling Connecticut is given less attention. The nine textbooks mentioning the founding of that colony describe Reverend Hooker as a dissenting Puritan spiritual leader who was forced to leave Massachusetts because of his religious views.

The religious motives of another rebel preacher, Reverend Roger Williams, are also noted. Thirteen texts describe his work in connection with the founding of Rhode Island. His views on freedom of conscience and the need for church-state separation are given a prominent place in the textbooks which describe the settling of that state.

Catholic efforts in settling Maryland are included in thirteen texts. As a rule, the economic motives of those who followed the Calverts to America are cited, along with the religious causes for the founding of the Catholic colony.

The significance of religious motives in the settlement of the Middle West and the Far West following the establishment of the United States is not omitted in the elementary school social studies textbooks. Ten of them mention Mormon contributions to the development of Utah and Salt Lake City. The extreme hardships and religious persecutions that this hardy band of settlers had to endure before settling in Utah find frequent mention in textbooks.

The pioneering work of Catholic missionaries along the western frontier is described in the textbooks studied. Father Marquette's explorations of the Mississippi Valley are discussed in ten books. Father Serra is mentioned for his work in the early settlement of California. Only one text mentions the role of Jesuit Missionaries in developing agriculture and cattle raising in the New World. As a whole, however, they are treated as important figures in the early exploration and settlement of the country.

The accomplishments of Protestant missionaries in the settlement of the United States are also cited. The work of Marcus Whitman and

Jason Lee in opening and settling the western parts of the American continent are discussed (Whitman in eleven books, Lee in seven). In general, the elementary school child learns from the textbooks that religious forces and people played a major role in the exploration, development and settlement of the area beyond the Appalachian Mountains.

The religious foundations of education in early America are mentioned in several of the texts. Sometimes the role of the churches is stressed, sometimes that of the missions.

One text, under the heading "Freedom of Education" says:

> "The Protestant colonists in New England built schools. They wanted their children to learn to read so they could use the Bible. As time passed, our founding fathers came to feel that every child must be educated so that he would be a better citizen. Everyone was taxed to provide free public schools."

A more detailed description of the contributions of the early American Puritans to the development of the public schools in this country is provided in the following excerpt:

> The Puritans believed in education and began to plan for schools almost as soon as they reached Massachusetts' shores. In 1636 they started Harvard College. A few years later they passed a law that every town of fifty families must have a teacher of reading and writing for its children. If a town had one hundred families, it must have a grammar school.
>
> These public schools helped to advance democracy. . . . In England children went to different schools according to their fathers' wealth or occupation. Here the children of the minister sat with the children of the fisherman. Farmers, merchants, and officials all paid taxes to support the schools and were proud of them. New England made a great contribution to American Democracy by encouraging public education.

Another school book states, "The Puritans wanted their children to be able to read their Bibles, so they started schools. In 1636 they started . . . Harvard College."

According to an intermediate grade book, in most cases reading and writing in early Philadelphia were taught by ministers. It says that the pupils did not spend as much time at church and school as did the children of New England; they received their schooling in church from the minister during his spare time.

Thus we see that the influence of religion on early education is emphasized in the textbooks. Credit is given to the public schools for advancing democracy, and it is implied that religion was the democratizing factor. It is true that in the Puritan public schools all children were educated together. But, of course, the education provided was Puritan even for non-Puritan children. It would be more accurate to credit the religious authorities of early New England with starting the first general educational system in America. Rich and poor alike were educated together.

It is clear, therefore, that textbooks give a strong impression of the vital importance of religion on the culture and society of the past. European culture from the time of Constantine to the eighteenth century is depicted as being permeated with religious influences. The effect of religion on Old World art, architecture, education, exploration and trade is shown to be a significant factor in their development. The contributions of religious leaders and missionaries to settlement, exploration and education in early America are also given a prominent place in the textbooks. The elementary school pupil receives an overall picture of religion as an important, beneficent factor in the social, cultural and political life of past periods.

Present-Day Religion. It is important to discover what picture the child gets of the part religion plays in contemporary society.

The most frequent way in which the role of religion in contemporary society is discussed is in terms of its influence on moral and spiritual values. For example, a sixth grade social studies textbook describes the importance of religion as a vital force in modern life as follows:

> As far back as we know anything about people, there has been religion. In practically every community in the world today there are leaders and workers in religion.
>
> The work of these people may make a great difference to the individuals in a community and to the community itself. Religion affects the inward disposition, or attitude, of the individual and sets standards of conduct by which people live. It encourages people to be law-abiding citizens. Because of religious faith, one group of people may patiently endure hardship. Another group may be led by their religious faith to take bold action to gain greater freedom or to improve their living conditions. Thousands of people, for example, have come to the United States for either of these reasons.

> All around the world today there are evidences of religious faith. . . . The buildings shown in the pictures suggest the importance of religion to people in different parts of the world.
>
> The first picture shows a church in a village in Mexico. The next picture shows a mosque in Nigeria, Africa. For one group of worshippers, Sunday is the holy day. For the other group, Friday is the special day for worship. The third picture was taken in Japan, showing a shrine or temple. In each of these places, there is at least one leader in religion.

Five elementary school social studies textbooks speak of the contributions of religion to contemporary society through church welfare institutions. The activities of churches in aiding the Red Cross in disaster areas is explained in one schoolbook. It describes how, after a flood, church workers prepared coffee for Red Cross rescue workers, and concludes with the observation that many "service clubs and churches" work together to help Americans "help each other."

An intermediate grade textbook describes the welfare work performed by churches at Christmas time, such as helping the sick and the poor and giving presents to hospitalized patients. The general benefits of having churches are described in another book in a single sentence which says, "Churches also make a country a good place in which to live."

The term "church" is not the most accurate one to use here since it excludes meeting houses, synagogues and temples. But the texts generally use the terms "religion" and "church" interchangeably. Would it not be better to use the more inclusive term "house of worship" and thus avoid sectarianism? In general, the texts show religion as a potent force working on behalf of the needy and distressed.

Textbook writers seem to use the term "churches" when they are talking about religion in general. One speaks of the beneficial effect of religion on moral and spiritual values in the Philippine Islands saying, "The Filipinos like to do right. They are deeply religious. Their country is full of churches, and those churches are well attended." This text goes further than simply to aver that there is a relation between "doing right" (which is a simple way of saying "adhering to moral and spiritual values") and being religious. It cites as evidence of religiosity a multiplicity of well attended churches. The passage contains three assumptions which are widespread in the textbooks, to wit: (a) Religious people do

right. (b) Religious people go to church. (c) It is good to go to church. By making these points in various ways, textbook authors convey the impression that the chief function of present-day religion is to preserve and enhance moral and spiritual values.

The difference between the way textbooks treat religion in the past and religion today is connected with the tendency to equate present-day religion with church-going. Whereas, in previous eras, religion is shown as playing a role in the lives of men which greatly influenced their arts, architecture, literature, trade, exploration and education, in addition to shaping their mode of worship and moral conduct, religion today is described as something primarily "church-bound," with an additional role in welfare work. Moreover, the numerous contributions of religion in the past to the cultural milieu are described in all the texts which deal with Old World and early American history. In contrast, the contributions of religion today are discussed in comparatively few texts. Among the factors generally omitted are the attendance of a large number of pupils in parochial schools, and that many public school pupils receive religious education in after-school classes and Sunday schools, and that many Americans consider marriage, birth and burial as religious occasions, intimately connected with religious ritual which indicates the extensive range of contemporary religious influence.

How textbooks treat religious holidays is of interest. In those books which mention Christmas and Easter, for the most part, their religious and historical significance are omitted. Textbooks give the impression that Christmas is a gift-giving festival devoid of any particular religious meaning.

Past and Present Judaism in the Texts. All the textbooks that deal with Jewish history place the main emphasis on the Biblical period and its legacy of monotheism. A typical text begins with the journey of Abraham and his followers, recounts the Egyptian persecution, the Exodus and conquest of Israel, David and Solomon, the division of the kingdom, and the eventual dispersion. The following typical description of the contribution of Jews to Western civilization is quoted from an intermediate grade textbook:

> The Jews lost their kingdom, but they did not lose their most valuable possession—their knowledge about God and His laws. . . .

> The Jews kept their belief in God and His law. They kept their belief in one God and their ideal that men served Him by the way they treated other men. In the years that followed, these ideals spread far over the world.
>
> The Jews . . . helped men see that they served God by helping other men.
>
> These ideals of the Greeks and the Jews were probably the most important things about living that men had learned.

This is the usual extent of the description of the history of the Jews in elementary school social studies textbooks. Only two texts say anything at all about the Jews during the entire eighteen century period from the destruction of the Temple at Jerusalem to the emergence of Czarist and Nazi anti-Semitism. One text describes the ghettos and the economic restrictions imposed upon the Jews in various Christian and Moslem lands. It also speaks of the good treatment the Jews received in Moslem Spain during the so-called "golden era."

The only other text to say anything about Jewish history between the Diaspora and the twentieth century, mentions the treatment of Jews in early Rhode Island. Discussing the establishment of this colony, it says, "Not long after Roger Williams established his colony, Jews came from other countries and other colonies to make their homes in Rhode Island. Here they found a land where they were free to worship as they pleased.'"

Thus the Jews are treated as a people whose main importance lies in the remote past, in an era that ended twenty centuries ago with the planting of the first seeds of the Christian religion. The Jewish people are portrayed as an antiquated group, one that long since ceased to contribute anything worthy of mention to Western civilization. They are pictured as the fossilized remnant of a once culturally productive people. The words of the Committee on the Study of Teaching Materials in Intergroup Relations of the American Council on Education are appropriate here:

> In view of the history of the Jewish people, their position today, and their relation to current world affairs, it would seem educational wisdom for pupils to be given a carefully balanced and adequate description of them. Actually, such a description is rarely present in the texts. . . .

> In the world history texts the story of the ancient Hebrews is commonly presented. . . . But the story of the Jews since 79 A.D. is to a large extent ignored, or presented only in connection with sporadic persecutions. . . .
>
> Such an unbalanced treatment does not seem to be historically justified. It tends to leave pupils with impressions of . . . an unchanging, an outdated group. . . .[20]

In addition to errors of omission which create the impression that Jews are outdated, the American Council on Education cited as an error of commission tending to create the same impression the following passage: "The Jewish nation reached the peak of its development 2,000 years ago."[21] A similar statement is found in an elementary schoolbook which states, "Under David and Solomon the Hebrew Nation reached its height."

In contemporary history, the chief importance assigned the Jews is a negative one as victims of persecution and exile.[22] The positive aspects of Jewishness are hardly considered. While the holidays, places of worship, and religious customs of Christians, Moslems, Hindus and Buddhists are mentioned by the texts, those associated with Judaism are virtually ignored. The impression conveyed, therefore, is that the Jew today is not distinguished by his customs, religion and culture, but by the hatred, contempt and scorn in which he is held by others. A student might very well conclude from the textbooks that the unique characteristic of the Jewish people is their susceptibility to persecution.

The Jew in America. While Christianity is depicted as having played a major role in the colonization and exploration of America, its present role is depicted as limited to the effect of the churches on moral and spiritual values and to social welfare services. On the other hand, according to the textbooks, the role of the Jews is the same today as it was in early America—all but non-existent. None of the texts used for this study discusses the Jewish role in community life. Tangential references to Jews include the Jewish ancestry of Lillian Wald and of the nurse of Calvin Coolidge's son, Ruth Freeman. These are no more than mere

---

[20] American Council on Education, *Intergroup Relations in Teaching Materials* (1949), p. 101.

[21] *Ibid.*

[22] See Chapter IV for details of the treatment of the religious persecutions of the Jews.

identifications. They cast no light on the culture or contributions of Jews to American society.

Summary. In early American elementary school textbooks religion was considered to be an important part of life. This was true in colonial times as well as in the nineteenth century. So great was the emphasis on religion that religious indoctrination seemed to be a major aim of textbook writers.

Today there is agreement among educators that although the instructional materials of the public schools should not be used for religious indoctrination, since religion is inextricably involved in history, art, music and politics, it is an intrinsic part of instruction in those fields. Religious leaders and important students of church-state affairs in this country are virtually in agreement with this concept of the place of religion in education.

Textbooks stress the importance of religion as a motivating force in the past history of mankind. The characteristics of early religion, such as the ancient faiths of the Babylonians, Egyptians and Greeks, are described and a clear picture is given of their role in the development of art, architecture, mathematics, sculpture, business and literature.

The past contributions of present-day religions are also given a prominent place by the textbooks. Moslems are usually credited with preserving and developing Greek contributions to science, mathematics, medicine, geography and philosophy. The cultural role of Christianity in past eras is stressed—the work of the monks in reviving learning; the role played by the church in establishing schools and universities; Christianity's contributions to art and architecture (though not to music). All textbooks dealing with the Crusades note their religious characteristics and discuss their role in trade, travel and exploration. Some texts criticize their excesses. The textbooks dealing with the Reformation describe the way in which this event engendered religious conflicts which were subsequently assuaged by the growth of religious tolerance when the futility of such strife was appreciated. The student of European history up to the eighteenth century cannot but be impressed by the great role which textbooks assign to Christianity in the development of European culture.

Except for the Jews, the contributions of religious groups and of missionaries to settlement, exploration and education in early America are also fully treated in the textbooks. Religious influences are portrayed as a favorable factor in the social, cultural and political development of the United States.

Elementary school social studies textbooks treat contemporary religion as being primarily a matter of church-going, with a limited role in welfare services and character education. Generally speaking, while the texts say that religion was important in the past they imply that it is no longer a significant force in our society.

Practically all of the information conveyed about the Jews relates to the Biblical period. The little information that is offered about Jewish history after the year 70 deals in the main with Jewish tribulations as victims of persecution and exile. Virtually nothing is given about the Jewish population of America. The strong impression is conveyed that the present-day Jew is not distinguished positively by his customs, religion or culture, but negatively by the hatred, contempt and scorn in which he is held by others. The Jewish group is also pictured as being outdated, having exhausted its contributions in the Biblical period.

Chapter IV

How Are Religious Conflicts and Persecutions Treated?

Recently, textbooks have been in the news because of charges that they deal inadequately with the Nazi persecution of Jews and other minorities.[1] Interest in intergroup relations has increased because the people of America have become increasingly mobile, and members of different religious groups come into contact with one another more than ever before.[2] In addition, because our population has become predominantly urban rather than rural, we are pressed in more closely upon one another now that the geographic frontier is gone. This normally leads to an increase in group tensions.[3]

These conditions make it important to see how elementary school textbooks treat the historical facts about religious conflicts and persecutions.

Pre-Hitler Persecutions of Jews

The impression conveyed by the texts is that since the beginnings of the Christian era the Jewish religion's main significance was to provide victims for persecution and deportation.

Egyptian Bondage. The earliest Jewish persecution that the textbooks discuss is the bondage in Egypt. This important period of Jewish

---

[1] V., e.g., *N. Y. Times*, Dec. 4, 1960, P. E-7 and Jan. 11, 1961, p. 27; *N. Y. Post*, Jan. 11, 1961, p. 20, May 31, 1960, June 3, 1960, Feb. 11, 1960; *N. Y. Herald Tribune*, Jan. 11, 1961, p. 1, Oct. 17, 1960; *Philadelphia Enquirer*, Feb. 21, 1960; *Denver Post*, Jan. 15, 1961; *Ohio Sentinel*, Jan. 19, 1961; *Miami Herald*, Jan. 12, 1961; *Milwaukee Journal*, Jan. 11, 1961; *Richmond News Letter*, Jan. 11, 1961; *Jewish Telegraphic Agency* (Dispatches), Jan. 11, 1961; *Education U. S. A.*, Jan. 19, 1961; *Publisher's Weekly*, Oct. 24, 1960; *Common Ground*, XIV, Winter, 1960; *The Jewish News*, Jan. 20, 1961, pp. 31-2; *The ADL Bulletin*, Jan. 1961, p. 1.

[2] American Council on Education, *Intergroup Relations in Teaching Materials*, pp. 5-6 (1949).

[3] *Ibid.*, p. 6.

history is treated in varying fashions by the texts. One social studies volume, for example, gives an account which is largely parallel to the Biblical narrative. The reason given for the new Pharaoh's cruelty after Joseph's death is that "By that time there were so many Hebrews that the Pharaoh was afraid they might become powerful enough to rise up against them." So Pharaoh ordered all newborn babies killed. The events surrounding the birth of Moses and his rescue by Pharaoh's daughter are outlined in accordance with the Biblical narrative. Moses' leadership of the Jewish people is described as follows:

> Again and again he begged the Pharaoh to let the Hebrews leave Egypt, but the Pharaoh did not want to lose his Hebrew slaves and refused to let them leave. All sorts of trouble came to the Egyptians. The people were afflicted with the plague and many of them died. Then the Pharaoh sent for Moses and said, "Get ye forth from among my people, both ye and the children of Israel. Take your flocks and herds and go."

The reason given by this text for the enslavement is in accordance with the Biblical account, namely, that the Pharaoh feared the increase of Jewish population; so, too, are the reasons for Pharaoh's letting the Jewish people go: the "trouble" and "the plague" visited upon the Egyptians.

In contrast to those texts which base their descriptions of the Egyptian bondage on the Bible, is the following:

> Egypt at the time was under the rule of the Shepherd Kings. They welcomed the Hebrews and gave them important places in the Kingdom. Some of the Hebrews helped the Shepherd Kings collect taxes from the Egyptians.
>
> During the reign of the Shepherd Kings, the Hebrews grew rich and powerful. But when the Egyptians arose and drove the Shepherd Kings from the throne, the Hebrews, too, suffered. Their wealth was taken from them, and they became captives of the Egyptians. Under the cruel lashes of their masters they were made to do many kinds of hard and unpleasant work. This was the beginning of a miserable existence which lasted many years.

Children familiar with the Biblical account of the death of Joseph and the rise of the king "who knew not Joseph" will find that this version of the enslavement of the Hebrews does not conform to what they learned. The reference to the Hebrews as tax collectors who

"grew rich and powerful" seems to be a reflection of the anti-Semitic canard that Jews are unscrupulous and oppressive in money dealings. About such allegations the noted archeologist William Foxwell Albright has said, ". . . they played their part in persuading an influential segment of German intellectuals that Nazi anti-Semitism was historically justified."[4]

Thus the non-Biblical version tends to discredit the religious teaching of home, church and synagogue. In addition, it lends the authority of the public school to the anti-Semitic stereotype of the Jew as an oppressive money manipulator. Finally, there is no evidence to support it. Should not textbook writers be advised to deal with the Egyptian bondage on the basis of the existing evidence?[5]

Babylonian and Roman Exiles. Although the Babylonian and Roman exiles were more than six centuries apart and the entire history of the Second Commonwealth of Israel fell between them, they are usually lumped together in the textbooks. Thus, one text concludes an account of the liberation of the Hebrews by Cyrus from Babylon with the following passage:

> . . . After their return from captivity in Babylon, the Hebrews began to be called Jews. Later, Palestine was taken by the Greeks and then destroyed by the Romans. Under the Romans, Jerusalem was destroyed and the Jews were driven out to become wanderers without a country of their own. Today they live in many countries.[6]

Another social studies textbook also discusses the Babylonian and Roman exiles together. After describing the liberation of the Jews by Cyrus it says:

> Never again did the Hebrews become powerful. After their return to Judah they were conquered and ruled by several different nations, one after another. Among these conquerors were the Romans, who taxed the Hebrew people so heavily that at last they revolted. Strong Roman

---

[4] W. F. Albright, *The Archaelogy of Palestine* (1954), p. 252, referring to an error "made by the famous German economist, Werner Sombart, in his book, *The Jews and Modern Capitalism* (1913)."

[5] In this connection, the following statement by Albright is of interest (*Ibid.*, p. 225): "The contents of our Pentateuch are, in general, very much older than the date at which they were finally edited; new discoveries continue to confirm the historical accuracy or the literary antiquity of detail after detail in it."

[6] For a discussion of the effect of calling the Jews homeless wanderers or people without a nation or country, see *infra*, section entitled *Roman Exile to Hitler.*

armies ended the revolt. In punishment the Hebrews were scattered far and wide. It was not until our own times, in the year 1948, that the Hebrews again had a nation of their own.

The entire Second Commonwealth is passed by, except to mention the suffering of the Jewish people during that period. The textbook story of the Jewish people from the year 586 B.C.E. forward is characterized as two exiles linked by oppressive persecution. The positive contribution of the Jewish people during that time was extremely important for the later history of western civilization. During the six centuries following the Cyrus Declaration, Jews kept alive the belief in one God despite the fact that all other nations on earth, including the persecutors of the Jews, worshipped idols. The three major religions of the western world, Judaism, Christianity and Islam, owe their existence to this fact. To stress, the negative significance of persecution while failing to take account of the preservation of ethical monotheism is to caricature history.

Only one text among those examined by the investigator says anything about the history of the Jews during the Second Commonwealth. This book emphasizes the preservation of the belief in the fatherhood of God and the brotherhood of man during the tumultuous period of the Second Temple. The manner in which this point is brought out (in a discussion of the Maccabean revolt) is of interest:

> The coming of Alexander and the Greeks to Palestine, after the defeat of Persia, brought changes for the Jews as well as for others. Some of them learned the ways of the Greeks and forgot the beliefs of their own people...
>
> Many of the Jews... did not want their sons and daughters to learn Greek ways. They feared that the young people would learn about new gods and forget about the true God. They might learn new laws and forget His law. . . .
>
> After Alexander's time the Greek king, who ruled Palestine as part of his empire, encouraged those Jews who adopted Greek ways. He made one of them chief priest. He also... put images of Greek gods in their temple at Jerusalem...
>
> The Jews would stand no more. Led by a strong man, Judas Maccabaeus, they armed and revolted against the Greek king and his supporters. The king had a far larger army, but Judas and his followers fought

so bravely that the king... agreed that they might live according to their own laws and under the rule of their own priests.

Following this sympathetic treatment of the Maccabean revolt the authors state:

> The Jews... kept their belief in one God and their ideal that men served Him by the way they treated other men. In the years that followed, these ideals spread far over the world.
>
> The Jews gave the world another great ideal. They helped men see they served God by helping other men.
>
> These ideals of the Greeks and the Jews were probably the most important things about living that men had yet learned.

Roman Exile to Hitler. Elementary social studies textbooks make as little mention of Jewish history between the Roman exile and Hitler as they do of the period between Cyrus and Titus. Only four of the texts in this study say anything at all about the Jews for the entire 1,863 year period between the Roman dispersion and the rise of Hitler. One of these, while discussing the voyage of Columbus, mentions that Isabella of Spain persecuted Jews and Moslems. Another, speaking of early Rhode Island, says, "Not long after Roger Williams established his colony, Jews came from other countries and other colonies to make their homes in Rhode Island. Here they... were free to worship as they pleased."[7]

The texts referred to in discussing the Jews after the Roman exile place major emphasis on their being victims of persecution or refugees from oppression. The third and final text dealing with the Jews after the Roman exile balances an account of their persecution with an account of their positive achievements. It devotes more space to Jewish history between the Roman exile and the rise of Hitler than does any other text examined. In a discussion of Jews in Moslem and Christian lands during the medieval period, it says:

> Wherever they lived, the Jews did not have an easy time. In Christian Europe they had to live in special sections of the towns and were forced to pay special taxes. Since they could not own land, they could not be farmers. Most of the guilds had rules which kept Jews out of the crafts. Only a few jobs were open to a Jew.

[7] No textbook mentions the persecution of religion under the communist governments.

> In Moslem Spain, Jews enjoyed greater freedom for many years. They owned land and entered any sort of business they wished. Some even became important advisers to the rulers. They built schools and encouraged young men to spend their lives in study. Some of the wisest men in the Moslem world were Spanish Jews. They not only studied their own books, they also knew the Arabic books as well.
>
> Later rulers of Spain declared that the Jews must either become Moslems or leave the country. Some did become Moslems, but many left Spain. It was hard to give up their homes, farms, and businesses but these Jews loved their faith more than anything else. They were willing to make the sacrifice.
>
> Wherever they went, the Jews kept the Jewish law and the sacred books which they believed God had given them. Whether they lived in Christian Europe or Moslem Egypt, they lived according to their ancient laws and customs. Their law and their religious faith bound the Jews of all lands together.

Most of the textbooks, then, fail to give any account of post-Biblical and post-Roman-exilic Jewish history. The few texts which mention Jewish life during this period tend to treat it in a cursory, passing manner, in connection with Jewish persecution and wandering. The impression conveyed by the texts is that the Jews are a group of wanderers who inevitably draw persecution down upon themselves. Only one text gives what might be considered a balanced picture of Jewish history.

Treatment of the Jews Under Hitler

Widespread interest in the textbook presentation of the facts about Nazism in Germany[8] began when the desecration of the Cologne synagogue on December 24, 1959, created a wave of concern about the possibility of a resurgence of Nazism. One of the first reactions was a call to examine German textbooks. They were found wanting in their explanation of Hitlerism and what it meant. On February 8, 1960, radio station WCBS in New York City broadcast an editorial called "The Handwriting on the Wall" which dealt with the paucity of references to Hitler's persecution of the Jews in history texts used in New York City public schools. The tenor of the editorial was that

[8] V. footnote 1 of this Chapter.

New York was no less wanting in the treatment accorded Nazism in its textbooks than West Germany was.

A survey by the *New York Post* of New York City high school texts generally substantiated the findings of WCBS.[9] New York City educators became concerned with the problem. On April 29, 1960, the Executive Board of the Association of the Teachers of Social Studies in New York City released a statement urging textbook authors and publishers to reconsider the fashion in which "the ghastly story of Nazi crimes and Nazi brutalities" was presented in high school history textbooks.

The New York City Board of Education launched its own investigation of high school textbooks, as a result of which a letter was sent to about 100 publishers requesting a revision of textbooks so as to convey to students an adequate knowledge and understanding of the evils of Nazism and totalitarianism. The letter, dated October 13, 1960, was signed by Ethel F. Huggard, Associate Superintendent of Schools, who was acting as Chairman of the Committee on Instructional Materials of the Board of Superintendents, the pedagogical arm of the Board of Education.[10] *Publisher's Weekly* commented on the letter in an editorial in its October 24, 1960 edition:

> If the New York request for more material spreads on a wide front to other school systems, it will take on added weight in textbook editorial planning. This does not mean that the industry wishes to "gloss over" this controversial subject; it *does* mean that sufficient *educational* reasons have yet to be put forward for expanding the treatment of this material.[11]

The *New York Times* reported a somewhat similar reaction from a "spokesman for the publishers." He said, "Textbooks are published for fifty states. I have no idea how many publishers will take action."[12]

Meanwhile the *Philadelphia Enquirer* checked twelve high school textbooks in use in that city. Their investigation revealed "a situation comparable to the one that shocked West German officials in the wake

---

[9] *New York Post*, Feb. 11, 1960.

[10] The full text of the letter can be found in the Intradepartmental Memorandum to Heads of Commissions in New York City, October 17, 1960, F Y I Memo #4. See, also, *New York Times*, Oct. 14, 1960.

[11] *Publisher's Weekly*, Oct. 24, 1960. Emphasis in original.

[12] *New York Times*, Dec. 4, 1960, p. E. 7.

of anti-Semitic violence in Germany. The West Germans discovered that their children were not being taught about the Nazi record of suppression, torture and mass murder. Philadelphia children are not either."[13] On the other hand the Department of History of the Public Schools of the District of Columbia concluded that the treatment of Nazi atrocities and persecution of the Jews in the high school textbooks of Washington was "fairly adequate."[14]

The most exhaustive study to date was made by Dr. Lloyd Marcus of the Program Division of the Anti-Defamation League. He examined forty-eight history and other social studies textbooks most widely used in American secondary schools. One of the four key areas which the investigation covered was the Nazi persecution of minorities. It confirmed the impression that textbook treatment of minorities under Nazism was inadequate. Dr. Marcus found that only nine of the texts examined by him gave a reasonably clear presentation of the Hitler period, and of these only one account of Hitlerism's effect on minorities was fully satisfactory.[15]

The Anti-Defamation League's investigation created widespread interest.[16] It quoted some inadequate material and gave detailed suggestions for improvement. Reaction from the publishers was given through the director of the American Textbook Publishers Institute, Dr. Austin McCaffrey. He said the A.D.L. Study "gives all the appearances of being very objective, very searching" and should command "a great deal of attention" throughout the industry. He concluded that most texts give a misleading and one-sided picture of minority groups and promised reform. In giving reasons for inadequate treatment of minorities Dr. McCaffrey said, "some of these books were written

---

[13] *Philadelphia Enquirer*, February 21, 1960.

[14] Department of History of the Public Schools of the District of Columbia, "An analysis of the Ways in Which Information about Nazi . . . Persecution . . . is Presented to Pupils in the Public Secondary Schools of the District of Columbia" (Mimeographed Report), March 15, 1960.

[15] Marcus, Lloyd, *The Treatment of Minorities in Secondary School Textbooks* (1961).

[16] See, e.g., *New York Herald Tribune*, Jan. 11, 1961, p. 1; *N. Y. Times*, Jan. 11, 1961, p. 27; *Denver Post*, Jan. 15, 1961; *Ohio Sentinel*, Jan. 19, 1961; *Miami Herald*, Jan. 12, 1961; *Milwaukee Journal*, Jan. 11, 1961; *Richmond News Letter*, Jan. 11, 1961; *Jewish Telegraphic Agency* (Dispatches), Jan. 11, 1961; *Education U.S.A.*, Jan. 19, 1961; *The Jewish News*, Jan. 20, 1961, pp. 31-2.

years ago. Times have changed; views and orientations have changed. No one will say that texts developed thus far are as good as they ought to be."[17]

Thus the reaction of textbook publishers changed from skepticism concerning the inadequacy of treatment of the Nazi era, to an admission that textbook treatment of minorities was one-sided. Their promise of reform shows their changing views concerning the importance of treating minorities in an objective manner. It is noteworthy that Dr. McCaffrey's reaction came after there was an "objective, very searching" investigation. The initial hasty undocumented surveys had not impressed the publishers to the point of their considering reform.[18]

All the investigations made to date of the manner in which the Hitler era is treated in textbooks concern high school history and social studies texts. No study of the treatment of this topic in elementary school texts precedes this report.

Treatment of the Hitler Era. Nazism in pre-war Germany is mentioned in eleven of the textbooks examined. Five of these, less than half, refer to the anti-Jewish or religious persecutions of Hitler.

A sixth grade social studies book discusses Hitler's anti-Semitism in story form. It shows the reaction of a young German to Jews after having joined a Nazi youth group. A pertinent excerpt follows:

> One night the police came to Max's house next door and took all the family away. Max's father was a doctor. His patients never saw him again. Hans came home to find his mother crying. Her neighbors had been very dear to her. "What will they do with them, Hans?" she asked her son.
>
> Hans laughed. "Take them to a prison camp I suppose. We have no room for such people in our new Germany. Max and his violin! We are well rid of them."
>
> "How can you say such things, Hans?" his mother asked. "Max's parents were always good to you. Have you forgotten how you boys used to play together when you were little? Max was your best friend."
>
> Hans gripped her arm. "I forbid you to say that," he shouted. "Max was never my friend. Max is a Jew. I hate him, as all good Germans

[17] *N. Y. Post*, January 11, 1961, p. 20.

[18] Originally, the results of the investigator's study was to be part of the ADL survey. However, this was changed pending revision.

hate all Jews. Never dare to say to anyone that I had a Jew for a friend. If you do, I will find a way to punish you."

She looked helplessly at him. What sort of world was this, where boys denied their friends and threatened to punish their mothers for speaking the truth? . . .

"Only three years ago," the father said, "We all sat around this table, happy and safe. Now . . . our son has turned against us. Such things cannot happen!"

Ways and means of preventing such occurrences in the United States are then discussed in the following manner:

How can we be sure that they will not happen in this country? In a democracy the leaders are never the masters. They are always the servants of the people. Chosen by the people, working for the people. Like any other bad servants, they can be replaced if they do not do their work well. Every man in office, from the President down, knows that this is true. Our greatest, wisest men are proud to call themselves public servants. If the day should ever come when our people were willing or careless enough to give up their rights, to bow before a leader as their master, then we should no longer be a democracy. So long as Americans love freedom, it cannot happen here.

The text gives a vivid example of the effects of anti-Jewish persecution during the Hitler regime. It is a frank presentation of the evil effects of prejudice and the danger of regarding the problem with complacency.

In the original edition of another book, the entire treatment of the relationship of Nazism to the Jews consisted of the following three sentences:

. . . The Jews were either killed or run out of Germany. Hitler believed they had accumulated too much wealth. Too, it was difficult to carry out his ideas with them because of their religion.

The authors maintained a neutral moral attitude—Hitler might be right or he might be wrong. As a matter of fact, the contention that "it was difficult to carry out his ideas with them because of their religion" might appear to be a justification of Hitler's persecution. This statement was more regrettable because the charge that governments cannot carry out their ideas with Jews is a classic anti-

Semitic slander. Haman used this very argument when requesting permission to destroy the Jews.[19]

A frequent anti-Semitic charge, that Jews are too rich,[20] is repeated in this book which says that Hitler believed this allegation. The authors make no comment on its truth or falsity. The treatment of the Nazi persecutions by this textbook was unwise and potentially harmful. A 1962 revision of the book contains a different treatment of Hitler's persecution of the Jews. After describing Hitler as an "evil man" and "power mad," the text explains how he deceived the Germans:

> He got them to hate the Jews by telling them that these people were too wealthy and caused a lot of their problems. He seized control of the newspapers and allowed only his Nazi party's ideas to get to the people. German youth as well as the adults were taught to hate —not only the Jews but other groups as well.

The text also comments on the millions of Jews Hitler put to death. Thus, the revised edition successfully eliminates the negative aspects contained in the first edition.

A third textbook treats Hitler's persecutions as follows:

> Hitler spent his time rounding up the people who did not agree with him. He hated the people of the Jewish religion especially. Within ten years he had killed or put into prison almost all the Germans of the Jewish faith. Some of them escaped to other countries. Many came to the United States.

The excerpt does not state whether Hitler's oppression was justified or not. The reason for the persecution which the text seems to advance, that Jews were among those who "did not agree with him," is at best only partly true and could lead to serious misunderstanding. Hitler's master-race delusions, the history of German anti-Semitism, the fact that Jews were made into scapegoats upon whom the blame for all German troubles were placed—none of this finds mention, although it would help to clarify why all Jews, regardless of their beliefs, were the victims of Hitler's evil schemes.

---

[19] Esther 3:8.

[20] Schneiderman, *et al., op. cit.*, p. 344.

Another elementary school social studies book says:

> Hitler... preached that the Germans were a superior kind of people ...his deepest hatred was for the Jews. Hitler said that no Jew could be a true German even though his family had lived in Germany for five hundred years.
>
> Unfortunately, Hitler found many Germans who were willing to believe what he said about the Jews, Times were hard. It was easy to believe that the Jews were responsible for Germany's troubles.

The error of Hitler's allegation is presented by this text and the credulity of the Germans is described as unfortunate. This is the only text among the five which explains Hitler's persecutions on the basis of the master race theory and the scapegoat device. Would not the presentation have been more effective if the reasons for Hitler's actions had been explained at greater length?

The persecution itself is described as follows:

> Ministers, priests, or teachers who disagreed with the Nazis were arrested and sent to prison camps, along with newspaper men, political leaders, and others. Jewish people fared the worst of all. Hitler accused the Jews of crimes of many kinds. What he said was not true, but because the Nazis made the laws and controlled the police, the Jews were helpless.

This makes it clear that Jews were not the only ones who were persecuted by Hitler. The authors mention specifically that Hitler's accusations about Jewish crimes were not true. The text's treatment of the subject concludes with the following paragraph:

> Thousands of Jews, including old people and small children, were herded into prison camps. Many died there. Some Jews were able to leave the country, although this meant that they must leave their homes and businesses, and build new lives in strange lands.

The cruelty and injustice of the Nazis is brought out when the authors, in the above selection, point out that old people and small children were among those "herded" into camps. The statement that many died, implies that the condition of the camps and the treatment of the prisoners were poor (although "many were *killed* there" would have been more accurate). The hardships of a refugee's life do not fail to find mention. However, this textbook treatment of the Nazi persecu-

tions while an improvement over the way others present it, contains inaccuracies. "Disagreement" with the Nazis was not the only basis for persecution. Race, past political affiliations, and even past social associations were also grounds for incurring the disfavor of the Hitler regime. Moreover, not "thousands" but millions of Jews were herded into camps.

The fifth schoolbook uses the Nazi religious persecutions to account for the huge increase in the Palestinian immigration after World War II. It says that while Hitler and his followers were in power "they murdered more than six million Jews, and millions of others became refugees in Russia and other countries."

To summarize, Hitler or the Nazis are mentioned in eleven of the schoolbooks examined. Five of these, or less than half, make reference to the persecution of Jews under Hitlerism. Of these five, one text does not indicate whether Hitler's policy was right or wrong. Only one text mentions Hitler's master-race theory. It is also the only one to give scapegoating as a reason for his Jew-baiting. Only one text discusses the necessity of preventing the growth of Nazism in a democracy. In general, textbooks give only a partial picture of Nazism, neglecting to explain the reasons for its rise, the evils of its existence, the fallacies of its philosophy or the means for its prevention.

Other Religious Persecutions

Unlike the textbooks' treatment of the Jews, where religious persecution is regarded as the chief characteristic of their history over a period of twenty-five centuries, persecution is regarded as only one of several factors in the treatment of other religious groups.

The Crusades. In a number of texts the Crusades are described as a movement to wrest the Holy City from the hands of the Mohammedans. Aside from dealing with the limitations placed upon the Christian pilgrims and the accounts of religious wars, only two texts describe what might be considered to be religious persecution in the sense of the harassment of civilian residents and refugees. One of these criticizes the Turkish Mohammedans who conquered Palestine. However, it describes the treatment of Christians by the Arabs as humane. The text expresses disaproval of the Turkish persecution of Christians,

but it also criticizes the behavior of the Crusaders after their capture of Jerusalem, in these words :

> Strangely enough, the Christians celebrated their great victory by murdering thousands of... helpless Mohammedan men, women and children in the... city which had been made holy by the life and suffering of the founder of a religion of love and kindness.

The author then contrasts this with the behavior of the Arab Moslems when they recaptured Jerusalem in 1187. ". . . The Mohammedans did not slaughter the Christians, but the crosses on the churches were torn down and the buildings became Mohammedan Mosques." Thus the Crusades are described as a movement in which there were both Moslem persecution of Christians and Christian persecution of Moslems. This text is the only one which intimates that the Crusades, though a spiritually inspired venture, were not without morally reproachable acts on the part of the Christian conquerors. This book alone, among those studied, tells the student that the eleventh and twelfth centuries were characterized by movements of persecution in which Moslems as well as Christians were victimized.

Another text suggests the cruelty of the Crusades by describing the great carnage at the capture of Jerusalem. Writing in the first person plural, the text asks students to follow along in the company of the Crusaders:

> ... We splash in blood as we ride. At nightfall we reach the church built over the tomb in which Jesus once lay. We lift our bloodstained hands in prayer...

The judgment of the authors in associating prayer and blood is doubtful. Certainly, portrayal of the cruel crusading conquerors, can be done without using the first person plural, which involves the young reader in splashing blood, and bloodstained hands lifted in prayer.

The Crusades, then, are described in all but two of the textbooks dealing with the subject as the result of Moslem persecution of Christians desiring to visit the holy places of Palestine. They say nothing about the counter-persecution of Moslems that took place after the Crusades began.

The Inquisition. The Inquisition is defined by one text as a court set up by the Church to try heretics. This is the only mention of the

Inquisition in the books studied. Inquisitorial trials are discussed in connection with the Reformation. Under this heading various incidents involving the heresy trials of such men as Wycliffe, Huss and Luther are described. (The manner in which these events are treated is discussed in detail in Chapter II, under the heading, "Textbook Treatment of the Reformation.") The Spanish Inquisition is not mentioned other than for a passing reference to it in a discussion of Ferdinand and Isabella's efforts on behalf of Columbus. The trial of Joan of Arc is mentioned in two texts. Neither of these explains the subsurface conflicts which culminated in the trial.

As was pointed out previously, the treatment of these trials form part of a general description creating the impression that Catholicism was infinitely more responsible for the intolerance of the era than Protestanism. No explanation other than the cruel bigotry of the Catholic officials is offered to the student. Even elementary descriptions of the political background of the events are lacking. No description of heresy trials conducted by Protestants, such as the trial of Thomas More, can be found. The picture presented by American elementary public school textbooks of the Inquisition is distorted in the over-emphasis of Catholic evils and omission of Protestant intolerance.[21]

Early American History. Religious persecution in early American history receives a great deal of attention in the texts. These references fall in two major categories: (a) religious persecution as a reason for emigration to the New World; and (b) restrictions on early colonists because of religious differences.

The religious persecutions undergone by different groups in the Old World are mentioned by the texts as an important reason for the migration of thousands to Colonial America. The Pilgrims, mentioned in twenty-two texts, are always depicted as having left Europe because of religious persecution. In twenty-three texts, similar reasons are given for the emigration of the Puritans. Fifteen social studies volumes tell

---

[21] An analysis of the manner in which American elementary public school social studies textbooks treat the Reformation was contained in Chaper II, section entitled, *Textbook Treatment of the Reformation.*

of the troubles of the Quakers as a minority religion in England and the role of William Penn in founding a Quaker colony in America where they could be free to worship without restriction. The work of the persecuted Catholics of England in settling Maryland is a topic of study in thirteen texts.

Through the story of these religious persecutions, the authors make the point that many of the original settlers regarded the opportunity to practice their religion a sufficient motive to emigrate to the New World. The importance of freedom of worship is usually discussed in connection with these events. Thus the theme of religious persecution with its relation to the settlement of America is used by the writers to show the heroism of sticking to one's religious convictions, and the necessity for the democratic concept of freedom for all, regardless of creed.

In addition to Old World persecutions of such groups as the Puritans, textbooks describe religious oppression in the colonies themselves by the very people who came to America to practice their faith without hindrance. This applies especially to the restrictions established by the Puritans in the Bay Colony of Massachusetts. Thus, for example, thirteen texts mention that Roger Williams[22] was forced to emigrate to Rhode Island; nine tell of persecutions of Quakers; and nine how Thomas Hooker was induced to found Connecticut because of Puritan intolerance.

Like the treatment of the persecutions of the colonists while they were still in Europe, these events in the colonies are used to demonstrate the concept of freedom of conscience and religion. Thus, the texts emphasize the important role religious convictions played in the early settlement of our country. The student is taught the importance of religious tolerance in the development of the American heritage and gains an appreciation of the courage men and women displayed in following the dictates of their conscience.

Summary. Because of recent attention given to the problem of intergroup tensions in the United States, educators have shown a renewed

[22] As was pointed out in Chapter III, section entitled *Religion in Early American History*, the views of Roger Williams on the subject of separation of church and state are given a prominent place by the textbooks.

interest in the manner in which the history of religious persecutions are taught in the schools. This chapter reports how American elementary school social studied textbooks deal with persecutions.

The earliest anti-Jewish persecution discussed in the texts is the Egyptian bondage. Some texts follow the Biblical version, others do not. The non-Biblical descriptions clash with the religious teachings given in home, church and synagogue. Some of these descriptions tend to abet the anti-Semitic characterization of the Jew as an exploiter and money manipulator. The evidence they use is purely speculative and without any solid basis.

The Babylonian and Roman exiles are lumped together by the texts. The entire intervening period of the second Commonwealth is largely ignored. By stressing the woes of these two exiles, without mentioning any significant events of the intervening 650 years, textbooks present a picture which lacks historical objectivity. Only one text changes this pattern and instead discusses the Maccabean revolt in positive terms.

The textbooks make as little mention of Jewish history between the Roman exile and Hitler as they do of the period between Cyrus and Titus. Only four texts refer to the entire eighteen-century period of Jewish history between the Roman dispersion and the rise of Hitler. The major emphasis in three of these texts is on the persecution of the Jews or on their wanderings as refugees, thus conveying the impression that they inevitably drew persecution down upon themselves.

Hitler and Nazism are a topic of study in eleven elementary school social studies volumes. Only five of these refer to persecution of the Jews under Hitlerism. Of these five, one does not indicate whether Htiler's policy was right or wrong. Only one text mentions scapegoating and Hitler's master race theory.

Whereas textbooks treat persecution as the characteristic element of Jewish history over the past twenty-five centuries, persecution of non-Jewish groups is treated in a more realistic perspective as one factor in an overall picture.

The treatment of the Crusades usually stresses the misdeeds of the Moslems of the period. Only two of the thirteen textbooks dealing with the Crusades say anything about Christian persecution of Moslems.

The Inquisition and the Reformation are presented in a way that creates the impression that Catholicism bears a far greater onus for the intolerance of the era than does Protestantism. Catholics are pictured as the agents of reaction and the Protestants are depicted as advocates of enlightenment.

Religious persecution in early American history is discussed in the texts in connection with the religious persecutions in European countries which led to the immigration to this country, and in connection with the oppression of early settlers by other colonists because of religious differences. These discussions demonstrate the meaning of the concept of freedom of religion and of the right to follow one's own conscience.

Chapter V

Summary

The major findings of this study can be summarized as follows:

1. The belief that nothing in the textbooks can violate the religious feelings of public school students is not true.[1] Many books present Protestantism in a more favorable light than Catholicism and Christianity more favorably than Judaism.

The most flagrant examples of anti-Catholic bias appear in the accounts of the Reformation. In describing the Reformation, textbooks stress Catholic persecutions of the emerging Protestant movements. A more objective picture would include an account of such movements as the Counter Reformation and thus make it clear that religious persecution was by no means a Catholic monopoly. If deep feelings of Roman Catholic students are not to be injured, it is imperative that the Reformation should be presented as a product of the social and political conditions of the time and not as a battle in which the forces of good freed themselves from the forces of evil.

The facts concerning Jewish history and Judaism, too, are presented in a manner that lacks objectivity and completeness. The relationship of Jesus to the Jews is often portrayed in such a manner that the Jewish leaders are made to seem arbitrary and cruel. References to Jews after the Biblical period, and mention of Jewish holidays, institutions and customs are virtually non-existent. The delicate subject of the Crucifixion is often dealt with imprudently, in a fashion that tends to stimulate prejudice.

---

[1] This belief was recently reiterated in *Life Magazine* as follows: "Textbooks today . . . are not merely free of anti-Catholic bias; they are written with such anxiety to avoid hurting the feelings of anybody at all that quite a few of the history books are no longer intelligible as history."—Robert Coughlan, "Religion and the Schools," *Life*, L., 24, June 16, 1961, p. 121.

The description of Christianity as a cultural and religious force is often parochial and unthinking. Some textbooks treat Christianity as being synonymous with everything good, so that by implication everything not Christian is bad. It is sometimes claimed that the Christian religion was the first to appeal to feelings of brotherly love; or that America is a Christian country based on Christian principles. It is sometimes assumed that all elementary school students are Christians and observe the Christian holidays such as Christmas. Such passages do violence to the religious sensibilities of many non-Christian students.

2. There are definite sectarian tendencies in the textbooks. A numerical analysis of the subject matter reveals a disproportionate quantitative predominance of references to Christianity, even after the predominance of Christians in our population is taken into consideration. This is in sharp contrast to the advice of the American Council on Education that an adequate description of Jews and Judaism be given by the texts.

The sectarian tendencies of the texts are manifested in their treatment of the life of Jesus. The majority of the passages dealing with the founder of Christianity imply his divinity or messiahship. Such treatment is sectarian since Jesus' divinity or messiahship is a Christian doctrine only. However, while the Constitution bars religious indoctrination it does not require ignorance. Therefore, the student should be taught about Jesus as an historical personage, and he should be instructed in the fact that Christians ascribe divinity to Jesus while others do not. This would satisfy the requirements of pedagogy as well as the Constitution's insistence on the state's neutrality in religious matters.

3. The texts portray present-day religion as no longer being a potent molding force in our society. This impression is conveyed by the tendency of American elementary public school social studies textbooks to discuss fully the role of religion in the past, but to give a sketchy, incomplete description of the part played by present-day religion in contemporary culture. Christianity is described as an all-pervasive influence in the development of European civilization and the settle-

ment and exploration of America. But present-day Christianity is depicted as being limited in its influence to moral and spiritual matters through church attendance, worship and welfare work. Practically all of the information conveyed about the Jews relates to events occurring over 2,000 years ago. Virtually nothing is said about Jewish life in America today.

One of the purposes of social studies textbooks, is to acquaint the student with important influences shaping the ways of life of other groups who are his neighbors. It is therefore unfortunate that the role of religion today in the way of life of millions, and as a cultural influence in families and social institutions, is neglected.

This important deficiency needs to be remedied by devoting more space in elementary social studies textbooks to such facts as: that millions of American children attend parochial and religious schools; that marriage, birth and burial are religious occasions in a large proportion of American families; that Christmas and Easter are religious holidays. Certain elementary facts about "minority" religions, such as the abstention from meat by Catholics on Friday or the fact that Saturday is the Jewish Sabbath, which concern the more obvious influences of religion on the American scene, should also be included in elementary social studies texts.

4. The historical facts about religious conflicts and persecutions are being presented in an inadequate fashion by the elementary social studies textbooks.

Almost all references to Jews after the Biblical period concern their suffering as a result of exile and religious intolerance. The texts leave the impression that Jews are a group of wanderers inevitably encountering persecution. As a people, they seem to lack positive attributes and to offer no cultural accomplishments since Biblical times.

The treatment of the Hitler period is unsatisfactory. Of the eleven elementary social studies volumes mentioning Hitler and Nazism, only five refer to the persecution of Jews under Hitlerism. Of these five, one takes an apparently neutral attitude by failing to indicate whether the Nazi persecution was justified or not.

When Protestant-Catholic friction is described in the texts, the reader is left with the impression that the Protestants were almost entirely without fault. Descriptions of Christian-Moslem friction, notably in the case of the Crusades, leave the impression that the Christians were practically blameless.

* * *

The Anti-Defamation League of B'nai B'rith presents this study with the hope that it will clarify some areas of concern, and will stimulate both investigation and the improvement of the treatment of religion in elementary school books.

61

Appendix

THE 120 ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEXTBOOKS USED IN THIS REPORT

Most of the 120 textbooks (grades 1-6) used for this report are in the collection of the Teachers' Central Laboratory of Hunter College. Other sources used were the Curriculum Bureau of the New York City Board of Education, the Teachers' College of Columbia University and the New York Public Library.

In the period intervening between the inception of research and the preparation of the final manuscript, several of these texts have been published in revised editions. Because of the nature of the publishing industry, it is to be expected that other books are undergoing revision and will appear before publication of this report or shortly thereafter. The present study has incorporated and noted significant changes in the revised editions available as of January, 1963.

1. Ames, Merlin M. and Jesse H. Ames. *America—Heir of Yesterday.* St. Louis: Webster Publishing Co., 1951. Grade 5.
2. ———— and ————. *My Country's Beginnings.* American Life History Series. St. Louis: Webster Publishing Co., 1951. Grades 4-5.
3. Badley, Theodore R. *North Africa* (Revised). World Geography Readers. Columbus, O.: Charles E. Merrill Co., 1950. Grades 4-6 (Paperback).
4. ————. *India* (Revised). World Geography Readers. Columbus, O.: Chas. E. Merrill Co., 1950. Grades 6-7 (Paperback).
5. Barker, Eugene C., Francis Cavanah and Walter P. Webb. *Our New Nation.* Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1957. Grades 5-6.

6. ————, Marie Alsager and Walter P. Webb. *The Story of Our Country.* Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1957. Grades 5-6.

7. Barrows, Harlan H., Edith Putnam Parker and Clarence Woodrow Sorenson. *Old World Lands.* Geography for Today's World. New York: Silver Burdett Co., 1959. Grade 5.

8. Brindl, Helen Van Bramer. *Your Land and Mine.* Democracy Series (Revised). New York: The Macmillan Co., 1951. Grade 3.

9. Burkhardt, Richard W. and Ann G. McGuinness. *Our Family.* Home Environment Series. Chicago: Benefic Press, 1954. Grade 1.

10. ———— and ————. *Our Home and School.* Home Environment Series. Chicago: Benefic Press, 1961. Grade 1.

11. ———— and ————. *Our Neighborhood.* Home Environment Series. Chicago: Benefic Press, 1961. Grade 2.

12. Burton, Mary June. *The East Indies* (Revised). World Geography Readers. Columbus, O.: Charles E. Merrill Co., 1949. Grades 6-7 (Paperback).

13. Bush, Maybell G. *Enjoying Our Land.* Democracy Series (Revised). New York: The Macmillan Co., 1951. Grade 2.

14. Carls, Norman and Frank E. Sorenson. *Neighbors Across the Seas* (Revised). Neighbors Series. New York and Philadelphia: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1959. Grades 6-7.

15. Carpenter, Frances. *Children of Our World.* New York: American Book Co., 1956. Grades 4-5.

16. ————. *Our Homes and Neighbors.* New York: American Book Co., 1956. Grade 3.

17. ————. *Our Little Neighbors at Work and Play.* New York: American Book Co., 1955. Grade 4.

18. Clark, Thomas D. and Daniel J. Beeby. *America's Old World Frontiers.* Chicago: Lyons and Carnahan, 1958. Grade 6.

19. ————, Ray Compton and Amber Wilson. *America's Frontier.* Wilkes-Barre, Penna.: Lyons and Carnahan, 1958 and Revised Edition, 1962. Grades 5-6.

20. Cordier, R. W. and E. B. Robert. *History of Young America.* Rand McNally Social Studies Series. New York: Rand McNally and Co., 1961. Grade 5.

21. ————. *History of World Peoples.* Rand McNally Social Studies Series. New York: Rand McNally and Co., 1961. Grade 6.

22. Creed, Virginia. *France.* Life in Europe Series. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1962. Grades 4-7.

23. Cutright, Prudence, Mae Knight Clark and Bernice Newell. *Living Together Today and Yesterday.* Macmillan Social Studies Series. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1958. Grade 3.

24. Devereaux, Vanza. *America's Own Story.* Living America Series. San Francisco: Harr Wagner Publishing Co., 1960. Grades 4-6.

25. Eibling, Harold H., Frederick M. King and James Harlow. *Our Beginnings in the Old World.* River Forest, Ill.: Laidlaw Bros., 1957. Grades 5-8.

26. ————, ———— and ————. *Our Country's Story.* River Forest, Ill.: Laidlaw Bros., 1958. Grades 4-6.

27. Ferguson, Erna. *Hawaii.* Life in America. 1960. Grades 3-5.

28. Grenzow, Daisy. *The British Isles* (Revised). World Geography Readers. Columbus, O.: Charles E. Merrill Co., 1950. Grade 6 (Paperback).

29. ————. *France* (Revised). World Geography Readers. Columbus, O.: Charles E. Merrill Co., 1950. Grade 6 (Paperback).

30. Hall, Dorothy. *Italy* (Revised). World Geography Readers. Columbus, O.: Charles E. Merrill Co., 1950. Grade 6 (Paperback).

31. Hanna, Paul R. and Genevieve Anderson Hoyt. *At Home.* The Basic Social Studies Program. Curriculum Foundation Series. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Co., 1956. Grade 1.

32. ———— and ————. *At School.* The Basic Social Studies Program. Curriculum Foundation Series. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Co., 1956. Grade 1.

33. ———— and ————. *Hello David.* Social Studies Curriculum Foundation Program. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Co., 1949. Grade 2.

34. ———— and ————. *In the Neighborhood.* Basic Social Studies Program. Curriculum Foundation Series. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Co., 1958. Grade 2.

35. ———— and ————. *New Centerville.* Social Studies Curriculum Foundation Program. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Co., 1948. Grade 3.

36. ———— and ————. *Peter's Family.* Social Studies Curriculum Foundation Program. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Co., 1949. Grade 1.

37. ———— and ————. *Someday Soon.* Social Studies Curriculum Foundation Series. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Co., 1948. Grade 2.

38. ———— and ————. *Tom and Susan.* Social Studies Program. Curriculum Foundation Series. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Co., 1951. Grades 1-2.

39. ———— and Clyde F. Kohn. *Cross-Country.* Social Studies Series. Curriculum Foundation Program. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Co., 1950. Grade 4.

40. Harris, Leila and Kilroy Harris. *Australia.* Life in Other Lands Series. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1959. Grades 3-5.

41. Hartman, Gertrude. *Builders of the Old World* (Second Edition). Boston: D. C. Heath and Co., 1959. Grades 5-6.

42. Hilliard, Pauline and Marion Nesbitt. *David Writes a Letter.* Social Learnings Readers. New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., Inc., 1954. Grades 1-3.

43. ———— and ————. *Greater Than Man.* Social Learnings Readers. New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., Inc., 1957. Grades 1-3.

44. Hills, Theodore and Sarah Jane Hills. *Canada.* Life in Other Lands Series. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1960. Grades 3-5.

45. Hoffman, George W. and Viola Hoffman. *Switzerland.* Life in Europe Series. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1961. Grades 4-7.

46. Hugley, Laura Mengert. *Everyone Wants A Home.* Rand McNally Primary Social Studies Readers. New York: Rand McNally and Co., 1950. Grade 1.

47. ———— and Ralph W. Cordier. *Friendly Neighbors.* Rand McNally Primary Social Studies Readers. New York: Rand McNally and Co., 1950. Grades 2-3.

48. ———— and ————. *Many Homes.* Rand McNally Primary Social Studies Readers. New York: Rand McNally and Co., 1950. Grades 3-4.

49. Irwin, William and Dorothy Irwin. *Australia and New Zealand.* Around the World Series. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1950. Grades 4-6.

50. Johnson, Eleanor M. and Zoe A. Thralls. *North American and Island Neighbors.* World Geography Readers. Columbus, O.: Charles E. Merrill Co., 1950. Grades 4-6.

51. King, Allen Y. and Ida Dennis. *The Way of Democracy.* Democracy Series (Revised). New York: The Macmillan Co., 1951. Grade 6.

52. Lansing, Marion. *Makers of the Americas.* (Second Edition). Boston: D. C. Heath and Co., 1959. Grades 5-6.

53. Lewis, Winnifred. *Islands of the Western Pacific.* Around the World Series. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1950. Grades 4-6.

54. Malmstrôm, Vincent H., and Ruth M. Malmstrôm. *Norway.* Life in Europe Series. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1959. Grades 4-7.

55. May, Stella Burke. *Brazil.* Life in Other Lands Series. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1962. Grades 3-5.

56. McConnell, W. R. *Geography of American Peoples.* Rand McNally Geographies. Chicago: Rand McNally Co., 1958. Grades 5-6.

57. ————. *Geography of Lands Overseas.* Rand McNally Social Studies Series. Chicago: Rand McNally and Co., 1951. Grades 4-6.

58. ————. *Geography of World Peoples.* Rand McNally Geographies. Chicago: Rand McNally and Co., 1952. Grades 4-6.

59. ———— and Jane McGuigan. *Geography of Many Lands.* Rand McNally Geography. Chicago: Rand McNally and Co., 1952. Grade 4.

60. McGuigan, Jane and Laura Mengert Hugley. *Around the Home.* Rand McNally Unified Blended Social Studies Series. Chicago: Rand McNally and Co., 1957. Grades 2-3.

61. McGuire, Edna. *Backgrounds of American Freedom.* Macmillan Elementary History Series. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1961. Grade 6.

62. ————. *The Story of American Freedom.* Macmillan Elementary History Series. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1961. Grade 5.

63. ————. *They Made America Great.* Macmillan Elementary History Series. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1961. Grades 3-4.

64. ————. *The Past Lives Again.* Macmillan Elementary History Series. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1950. Grade 6.

65. Moore, Clyde B., *et al. Building Our America.* Scribner-Bobbs Merrill Social Studies Series. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1961. Grades 5-6.

66. ————, ————. *Building Our Communities.* Scribner-Bobbs Merrill Social Studies Series. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs Merrill Co., 1961. Grade 4.

67. ————, ————. *Building Our Town.* Scribner-Bobbs Merrill Social Studies Series. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs Merrill Co., 1957. Grade 3.

68. ————, ————. *Building Our World.* Scribner-Bobbs Merrill Social Studies Series. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs Merrill Co., 1958. Grade 6.

69. ———— and Dorothy E. Cooke. *Visiting Our Neighbors.* Scribner-Bobbs Merrill Social Studies Series. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs Merrill Co., 1957. Grade 2.

70. ———— and ————. *Working and Playing.* Scribner-Bobbs Merrill Social Studies Series. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1957. Grade 1.

71. Morgan, Edna. *Pioneering in Democracy.* Democracy Series (Revised). New York: The Macmillan Co., 1951. Grade 5.

72. Morgan, Juliet and E. L. Keithahn. *Alaska and Hawaii.* Around the World Series. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1956. Grades 4-6.

73. Nemec, Lois G. *Let's Take Turns.* Democracy Series (Revised). New York: The Macmillan Co., 1950. Grade 1.

74. ————. *School Friends.* Democracy Series (Revised). New York: The Macmillan Co., 1951. Grade 1.

75. Nystrom, J. Warren, Emlyn D. Jones and Helen Harter. *Beyond Our Borders: Canada and Latin America.* Rand McNally Unified Blended Social Studies Series. Chicago: Rand McNally and Co., 1961. Grades 5-6.

76. O'Donnell, Mabel. *Chinese Children.* Row-Peterson Film-Story Books. Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1951. Grades 4-6. (Paperback).

77. ————. *Italian Children.* Row-Peterson Film-Story Books. Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1951. Grades 4-6 (Paperback).

78. ————. *Japanese Children.* Row-Peterson Film-Story Books. Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1951. Grades 4-6 (Paperback).

79. ————. *Norwegian Children.* Row-Peterson Film-Story Books. Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1951. Grades 4-6 (Paperback).

80. ————, and Elizabeth Bloss. *English Children.* Row-Peterson Film-Story Books. Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1951. Grades 3-4 (Paperback).

81. ———— and ————. *French Children.* Row-Peterson Film-Story Books. Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1951. Grades 3-4. (Paperback).

82. ———— and ————. *Spanish Children.* Row-Peterson Film-Story Books. Evanston, Ill.: Row, Peterson and Co., 1951. Grades 4-6. (Paperback).

83. Poole, Sidman P., Thomas F. Barton and Clara Belle Baker. *From Season to Season.* Geography Foundation Series. Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1959. Grade 2.

84. ————, ———— and ————. *In Country and City.* Geography Foundation Series. Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1959. Grade 3.

85. ————, ———— and ————. *Through the Day.* Geography Foundation Series. Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1959. Grade 1.

86. ————, ———— and Irving R. Melbo. *The World About Us.* Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1948. Grade 4.

87. Raman, T. A. *India.* Life in Other Lands. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1962. Grades 3-5.

88. Robinson, Ruth Mills. *Toward Freedom.* Democracy Series (Revised). New York: The Macmillan Co., 1951. Grade 4.

89. Ross, Patricia Fent. *Mexico.* Life in Other Lands. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1961. Grades 3-5.

90. Russel, Mary. *Great Britain and Canada.* Around the World Series. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1950. Grades 4-6.

91. Smith, J. Russell and Frank E. Sorenson. *Neighbors Around the World.* Neighbors Series. New York and Philadelphia: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1959. Grade 4.

92. ———— and ————. *Neighbors in the Americas* (Revised). Neighbors Series. New York and Philadelphia: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc. 1957. Grade 5.

93. ———— and ————. *Neighbors in the United States and Canada.* Neighbors Series. New York and Philadelphia: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1957. Grade 6.

94. ———— and ————. *Our Neighbors at Home.* Neighbors Series. New York and Philadelphia: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1960. Grade 3.

95. Smith, Marie Elizabeth. *Bill's Story of the Wholesale Produce Market.* Social Learnings Readers. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1951. Grades 1-3.

96. ————. *Bob's Story of the Retail Food Market.* Social Learnings Readers. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1951. Grades 1-3.

97. ————. *Joe's Story of the Airport.* Social Learnings Readers. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1951. Grades 1-3.

98. ————. *Mother's Story of Dairying.* Social Learnings Readers. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1951. Grades 1-3.

99. ————. *Ships Come and Go.* Social Learnings Readers. Indianapolis and New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1954. Grades 1-3.

100. Sorenson, Clarence Woodrow. *A World View.* Geography for Today's World. New York: Silver Burdett Co., 1959. Grades 6-9.

101. ————. *Ways of Our Land.* Man's Ways and Times Series. New York and Morristown, N. J.: Silver Burdett Co., 1954. Grades 3-7.

102. Southworth, Gertrude Van Duyn and John Van Duyn Southworth. *Long Ago in the Old World.* Columbus, Ohio: Iroquois Publishing Co., 1959. Grades 4-6.

103. Stull, DeForest and Roy W. Hatch. *Journeys Through Many Lands* (Revised). Stull-Hatch Geographies. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1960. Grade 4.

104. ———— and ————. *Journeys Through the Americas* (Revised). Stull-Hatch Geographies. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1960. Grade 5.

105. Thomas, Eleanor. *Your Land and Mine.* Tiegs-Adams Social Studies Series. Boston: Ginn and Co., 1960. Grade 3.

106. Thurston, Ernest L. and Grace Croyle Hawkins. *Homelands of the Americas.* Homelands Series. Columbus, Ohio: Iroquois Publishing Co., 1960. Grades 5-6.

107. ———— and ————. *Homelands of the World.* Homelands Series. Columbus, Ohio: Iroquois Publishing Co., 1960. Grade 4.

108. ———— and ————. *Homelands Beyond the Seas.* Homelands Series. Columbus, Ohio: Iroquois Publishing Co., 1960. Grades 6-8.

109. Todd, Lewis Paul and Kenneth S. Cooper. *New Ways in the New World.* Man's Ways and Times Series. Morristown, N. J.: Silver Burdett Co., 1960. Grade 5.

110. ———— and ————. *Old Ways and New Ways.* Man's Ways and Times Series. Morristown, N. J.: Silver Burdett Co., 1954. Grade 4.

111. ———— and ————. *World Ways.* Man's Ways and Times Series. Morristown, N. J.: Silver Burdett Co., 1960. Grade 6.

112. Tompkins, Stuart R. *Alaska.* Life in America Series. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1961. Grades 3-5.

113. Townsend, Herbert. *Our Wonderful Earth.* Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1951. Grade 3.

114. Van Embden, M. der Groot. *The Netherlands.* Life in Europe Series. Grand Rapids, Mich.: The Fideler Co., 1960. Grades 4-7.

115. Whipple, Gertrude and James E. Preston. *At Home on Our Earth: The United States and the British Commonwealth* (Revised Edition). Whipple and James Basal Geographies. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1955. Grade 5.

116. ——— and ———. *Living on Our Earth* (Revised). Whipple and James Basal Geographies. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1955. Grade 3.

117. ——— and ———. *Our Earth* (Revised Edition). Whipple and James Basal Geographies. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1954. Grade 3.

118. ——— and ———. *Our Earth and Man* (Revised Edition). Whipple and James Basal Geographies. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1955. Grade 6.

119. ——— and ———. *Using Our Earth* (Revised Edition). Whipple and James Basal Geographies. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1954. Grades 3-4.

120. Wolfe, Ruth A. *North and South Polar Regions* (Revised). World Geography Readers. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Co., Inc., 1950. Grades 4-6 (Paperback).

OTHER ADL RESEARCH STUDIES

THE TREATMENT OF MINORITIES IN SECOND SCHOOL TEXTBOOKS. Lloyd Marcus. (50¢)

THE SWASTIKA "EPIDEMIC" AND ANTI-SEMITISM IN AMERICA. Oscar Cohen. (25¢)

SWASTIKA 1960: *The Epidemic of Anti-Semitic Vandalism in America.* David Caplovitz and Candace Rogers. (75¢)

THE 1960 SWASTIKA SMEARINGS: *Analysis of the Apprehended Youth.* Martin Deutsch. (25¢)

WHAT HIGH SCHOOL STUDENTS SAY: *A Survey of Attitudes and Knowledge About Jews and Nazism.* (35¢)

CHRISTMAS IN THE LIFE OF A JEWISH TEENAGER. Irving Canter. (25¢)

"PRIVACY" AND PREJUDICE: *A Survey of Religious Discrimination in Social Clubs.* ADL Staff. (25¢)

SMALL-TOWN JEWS AND THEIR NEIGHBORS. Peter Rose. (25¢)

CLINTON, TENNESSEE: *School Desegregation Crisis.* Anna Holden, Bonita Valien, Preston Valien and Francis Mania. (25¢)

DALLAS, TEXAS: *Factors Affecting School Desegregation.* William Carmack and Theodore Freedman. (50¢)

RELIGIOUS PRACTICES IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS OF TEXAS. Earl Humble. (40¢)

RESEARCH BULLETIN ON INTERGROUP RELATIONS. Society for the Study of Social Problems, Society for the Psychological Study of Social Issues in Cooperation and the Anti-Defamation League. ($1.50)

AN INVENTORY AND APPRAISAL OF RESEARCH ON AMERICAN ANTI-SEMITISM. Melvin M. Tumin. ($4.00—hard cover; $2.75—soft cover)

ADL Research Studies are produced under the direction of Mr. Oscar Cohen, director, program division.